



Tasma Terrace  
 4 Parliament Place  
 East Melbourne  
 Victoria 3002

Email: info@nattrust.com.au  
 Web: www.nattrust.com.au

T 03 9656 9800  
 F 03 9650 5397

21 October 2014

Anne-Marie Edgley  
 Planning Officer  
 City Planning and Infrastructure  
 City of Melbourne  
 GPO Box 1603  
 Melbourne VIC 3001

Dear Ms Edgley,

**RE: Goodrest (Simonds Hall), 120-126 Toorak Rd West, South Yarra VIC 3141**

Goodrest is classified by the National Trust of Australia (Victoria) as being of State significance.

We have noted the proposed development plans stamped 27 December 2014, to redevelop the rear half of the site, and to reconfigure the front garden for underground car park access and egress.

We are disappointed to note that the current development application does not make any provision for *in situ* retention of three significant trees, listed on the City of Melbourne's Exceptional Tree Register:

- Tree # 163 *Phoenix canariensis*
- Tree # 164 *Phoenix canariensis*
- Tree # 165 *Cupressus sempervirens* (row of 11 trees)
- Tree # 166 *Salix babylonica*

Table 1. Excerpt from Environmental Significance Overlay - Schedule 2.

120 Toorak Road SOUTH YARRA	<i>Phoenix canariensis</i> Canary Island Date Palm	Historical Value. Aesthetic Value. Particularly Old, Location or Context.	8.52	131	11ESO	This is a large specimen in good condition, particularly in context with its built surrounds. It is one of a pair that dominates the entrance to the heritage listed Simonds Hall.
120 Toorak Road SOUTH YARRA	<i>Phoenix canariensis</i> Canary Island Date Palm	Historical Value. Aesthetic Value. Outstanding Size. Particularly Old, Location or Context.	4.44	132	11ESO	This is a large specimen in good condition, particularly in context with its built surrounds. It is one of a pair that dominates the entrance to the heritage listed Simonds Hall.
120 Toorak Road SOUTH YARRA	<i>Cupressus sempervirens</i> Italian Cypress	Outstanding Size. Historical Value. Aesthetic Value. Particularly Old, Location or Context.	6.10	133	11ESO	This tree forms part of a row of cypress trees which are in good condition and likely to have been part of the original plantings of the heritage listed Simonds Hall.
120 Toorak Road SOUTH YARRA	<i>Salix babylonica</i> Weeping Willow	Aesthetic Value. Particularly Old.	27	134	11ESO	This is an old specimen in good condition particularly in an urban context. It is likely to have been part of the original plantings of the heritage listed Simonds Hall.

We note that the development plans indicate the two *Phoenix canariensis* (Canary Island Date Palm) are proposed to be removed and repositioned in the new garden, and the *Salix babylonica* (Weeping Willow) is proposed to be wholly removed. Further, the tree protection zones (TPZs) marked on

Sheet 3 of 19 of the advertised plans do not appear to be adequate in scale, based on the TPZs recommended in the Exceptional Tree Register Assessment Form (enclosed).

We object to the removal or movement of these trees on the basis of their age, aesthetic value, and their landscape context significance *in situ*, forming prominent plantings within the garden of a historic place. The *Salix babylonica* is over 100 years in age, it is in good condition with a Safe Useful Life Expectancy (SULE) of 31-60 years. Similarly, the SULE for the *Phoenix canariensis* is 21-30 years.

We would be pleased to hear from you regarding the City of Melbourne's assessment of the development application.

If possible, we would be pleased to receive the report from a suitably qualified arborist, which identifies the reason and need for the proposed works, options for alternative treatments and any remedial or restorative action proposed.

I am contactable on 03 9656 9837, and looking forward to hearing from you at your convenience.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'A Foley', written in a cursive style.

Anna Foley

Senior Advocate, Environmental Heritage