



MELBOURNE SOUTH YARRA RESIDENTS GROUP INC.

Established by the residents of South Yarra in 1969

8 January 2015

Mr Stephen Vecris
Senior Planning Officer | Planning and Building
City of Melbourne
GPO Box 1603
MELBOURNE VIC 3001

By email: stephen.vecris@melbourne.vic.gov.au

Dear Sir

Application TP-2014-780 - Bromby Street, South Yarra

Having considered the response from Nicholson Planning and Development to our objection to this building we maintain our strong objection and make the following comments.

When you put to one side the largely irrelevant issues raised in that letter, one thing is plain and is not in dispute, namely, that if the building is to be permitted it must:

"...be compatible with the scale and character of the South Yarra area."

or words to that effect.

What is also plain from the plans presented is that the height, bulk, colour and design of the proposed building is not compatible with the scale or character of South Yarra and that the applicant has made absolutely no attempt to satisfy this requirement.

All the applicant says in an attempt to satisfy this essential condition and our responses are as follows.

1. "The proposed new building is to replace an existing building and will be similar in terms of scale and proportion and, significantly, will be similar in terms of its footprint and presentation to the street. The building will be taller but is well removed from housing by the generous scale of Domain Street and its median, and the width of Bromby Street and its impressive canopy of mature trees which will serve to filter views both when in full canopy and when not in leaf".

The building might have a similar footprint to what is there now but nothing else is similar. The building is some three metres higher and its colour, design and bulk increases its impact upon the immediate area in a manner that is significantly greater than at present. Furthermore, while Domain Street might be of a "generous scale", Bromby Street is certainly not and in both of those streets the residences are almost all single or two-storey with considerable heritage value and of a small scale that will be overwhelmed by the mass of the proposed new building.

PO Box 3050, South Yarra 3141

secretary@msyrg.com.au

www.msyrg.com.au

The "impressive canopy of mature trees which will serve to filter views both when in full canopy and when not in leaf" will be of no consolation to those in Domain Street and of little if any consolation to those in Bromby Street, particularly in winter or should those trees not remain.

2. The Applicant acknowledges that this issue "calls up the consideration of the proposed building within its context" but then goes on to say "the context of the proposed building is not the fine grain scale of the residential streets of the balance of this part of South Yarra and it would be improper to assess it against such built form given the school occupies a whole street block with fronts on to St Kilda Road and the Domain."

The size and location of the total school property is irrelevant. The new building is not being assessed against the buildings in St Kilda Road but rather the small scale heritage area which this building will overlook and this is the context in which it must be judged. To say later in this letter from Nicholson Planning and Development that the bulk of this building will not have any adverse impact "given its context and backdrop of St Kilda Road" demonstrates no understanding that it has nothing to do with St Kilda Road but everything to do with the residents in the area near the building.

The Applicant acknowledges that DDO 15 and the policies contained in the Melbourne Planning Scheme require this building to be "compatible with the scale and character of the South Yarra area" but there is absolutely nothing in the size, bulk, colour or design to demonstrate that the applicant has made the slightest attempt to satisfy this requirement and the application should therefore be refused.

Yours sincerely



Michael Butcher
President

P.S. All members of the Melbourne South Yarra Residents Group, including those who live in Domain Street or nearby, are affected by and concerned about applications such as this and will do all they can to discourage bad planning applications or decisions.