

MELBOURNE SOUTH YARRA RESIDENTS GROUP INC.

SOUTH YARRA PRECINCT HO6

SUB-PRECINCTS DRAFT STATEMENTS OF SIGNIFICANCE

Introduction

This revised document has been prepared for the Melbourne South Yarra Residents Group Inc. by Nigel Lewis Pty Ltd, on 14 May 2015, with input from the MSYRG, and the Heritage Precincts Background History and Significance Assessments - Statement of Significance for South Yarra. This is noted as a reference document to the Melbourne Planning Scheme.

The following draft statements of significance are for the key sub-precincts of the South Yarra Precinct. Other sub-precincts that could also be covered in this form could be for the east end of Domain Road and Domain Street. The balance of HO 6 could be covered by an overall statement for the South Yarra precinct, with specific statements for individual Heritage Overlays.

Alternatively, the proposed sub-precincts in this document could be designated as individual HO precincts.

The statement of significance for HO 6 should be based on the Heritage Precincts Background History and Significance Assessments - Statement of Significance for South Yarra. This document is based on the 2004 City of Melbourne Heritage Precincts Project study by Meredith Gould Architects Pty Ltd.

AIRLIE STREET SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The 1880s Airlie Street subdivision and adjacent subdivision of The Righi, on the south side. All housing from the 1880s to the 1920s, and the extant historic development pattern.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the Victorian era and Edwardian era single storey houses and two storey terraces, many freestanding;
- the combined overall architectural and streetscape values of the 1880s era to the Inter-war Federation era;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the 1880s – early 1900s housing;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys, and many terra cotta and slate tiles;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are no buildings with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- bluestone kerbs and channels; and
- expansive elevated views looking north.

How is it significant?

The Airlie Street Sub-precinct is of local historical and aesthetic significance.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Airlie Street Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing development from the 1880s to the 1920s.

Aesthetically it is significant for its distinctive urban form and streetscapes.

History and description

The Airlie Street and The Righi subdivision formed part of the larger subdivision of the 1880s which subdivided the original 1840s *Fairlie House* allotment that extended between Anderson Street and Punt Road. There was a vineyard of the site of this sub-precinct.¹ While some properties were built soon after the original subdivision, others were not built for another fifteen to thirty years, during the period of recovery from the 1890s depression. There were no apartment buildings and all buildings were one or two storeys.

All the houses built in this area before the 1920s provide a harmonious combination of architectural forms and materials, and contribute to the heritage significance of the sub-precinct. Many demonstrate a high level of integrity, but even buildings that have been altered are of significance.

This sub-precinct has an idiosyncratic configuration that is defined by the steep gradient which provides expansive views to the north. The topography provides a distinctive tree lined streetscape with small front gardens, small Victorian and Edwardian homes, large two storey Victorian terraces and large freestanding houses. While the larger two story houses have a strong streetscape presentation with a number of landmark buildings, the predominant streetscape is low scale.

¹ Kearney - *Melbourne and its Suburbs*, map compiled by James Kearney for Captain Andrew Clarke, Surveyor General, 1855; henceforth noted as Kearney etc.

HOPE STREET SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The 1850s and 1872 Hope Street subdivisions with Domain Road and Toorak Road frontages respectively.

All housing from the 1850s to the 1920s, and the extant historic development pattern:

- the creation of Hope Street through two different subdivisions;
- the different layout and development pattern of each subdivision; and
- how 119, 121 and 123 Domain Road and *Melrose*, provide a physical and historic bookend to Domain Road, as does the former *Fawner Club Hotel* to Toorak Road West, as well as representing the contrast between this narrow street of workers housing and larger buildings facing major roadways.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the Victorian era and Edwardian era single storey cottages, mainly conjoined;
- the combined overall architectural and streetscape values of the 1850s era to the post Federation era;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the 1880s – early 1900s terrace housing;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and slate tiles;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are no buildings with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- the integrity of the southern part of the street is relatively high;
- bluestone kerbs and channels; and
- views looking north to the Botanic Gardens south to Fawkner Park.

How is it significant?

The Hope Street Sub-precinct is of local historical and aesthetic significance.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Hope Street Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing development from the 1850s to the 1920s.

Aesthetically it is significant for its unusual layout and small scale streetscapes.

History and description

The first plan showing Domain Road and Domain Street was prepared in 1840 the allotments created were sold in 1846 and 1849. Sometime after 1864² a narrow cul-de-sac called Montpelier Parade ran off Domain Road to the east of Domain Street. It was created in the 1850's to form a small subdivision. On the eastern corner with Domain Road three terrace houses, 119, 121 and 123, were built in 1855 for Charles Joseph Mills. These still remain, albeit in an altered state, although the west gabled elevation is relatively intact. The middle house was occupied from 1861 to 1863 by the Government Meteorologist and Director of the Observatory, Georg von Neumayer.

² Cox - *Hobson Bay and River Yarra leading to Melbourne*, map based on survey by Commander H.L. Cox R.N., 1864; this map shows details of all subdivisions and buildings in addition to navigation information, henceforth noted as Cox etc.

On the west side corner is *Melrose*, built in 1876 with architect Joseph Crooke as a private residence.

To the south of this early subdivision a 4 acre block was bought by William Stevenson in 1849, a brick maker who in 1853 built the original *South Melbourne Hotel* on Gardiner's Creek Road. A wider street was created by a subdivision to the south in 1872, linking to Toorak Road. This is offset to the west with a dog-leg connection to the original cul-de-sac, now all renamed as Hope Street. There are narrow pedestrian lanes to Millswyn Street and Domain Street. In 1876 Gardiner's Creek Road was renamed Toorak Road and the hotel was rebuilt on the corner of Hope Street. In 1887 this was renamed the *Fawkner Club Hotel*.

The southern section comprises pairs of small Victorian and Edwardian cottages built in the 1880's to 1915. These relatively intact, and the streetscape is intact other than for several small blocks of flats at either end.

References:

L. Oscar Slater, *Walking Melbourne's Domain Parklands*, 2004

Oscar Slater, *Walking tour of South Yarra West*, 2004

<http://trove.nia.gov.au/list?id=62649>

<http://trove.nia.gov.au/list?id=62589>

<http://www.portrait.gov.au/portraits/2009.72/georg-von-neumayer>

LEOPOLD STREET SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The Leopold Street subdivision including Toorak Road and Domain Road frontages.

All housing from the 1880s to the 1940s, and the extant historic development pattern:

- the creation of Leopold Street through two different subdivisions, on the west side linked with Park Street, and on the east side with the concurrent development of *Goodrest*;
- the pattern of development of the 1880s houses with many built in pairs by builder/developers;
- how *Goodrest* as a Boom-era mansion, provides a physical and historic bookend to Toorak Road West, as well as representing the demographic contrast between this narrow street of workers housing and grand mansions facing major roadways;
- the manner in which the depression of the 1890s made a clear separation from the post Federation and Interwar period of development particularly on the east side, as well as the manner in which the gradual loss of the grounds of *Goodrest* in the 1920s and 1930s is clearly demarcated by Interwar flat developments; and
- the linkage of the Interwar developments of *Goodrest* with the very significant Interwar precinct that comprises all of Marne Street.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the Victorian era housing which define the Melbourne land boom, both single storey and larger two storey terraces;
- the Edwardian era houses, both single storey and two storey, mainly conjoined;
- the Interwar houses and apartments, mainly two storeys, but also single storey and three storey;
- the combined overall architectural and streetscape values of the 1880s era, the post Federation era and the Interwar era and the manner in which the later periods are respectful of the 1880s terrace housing;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the 1880s terrace housing;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and terracotta tiles;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms; buildings with strong horizontal elements and unrelieved walls are the exception;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are no buildings with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- the overall integrity of all the significant periods of development in 2015, with only one house being demolished from the 1880s era; and none from the subsequent eras up to the 1940s;
- the integrity of much of the street is very high, houses and flats survive largely unaltered and the area is notable for the absence of prominent additions and alterations;
- despite being completely out of scale and building form, Domain Towers provides a landmark of post war modernism that provides, another significant value of the precinct;
- bluestone kerbs and channels; and
- views looking south to large trees in Fawkner Park.

How is it significant?

The Leopold Street Sub-precinct is of local historical and aesthetic significance.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Leopold Street Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing development from the 1880s boom to the 1940s. It also demonstrates the manner in which large mansion allotments of the 1850s were redeveloped, and how these were set adjacent to areas of working class housing. Aesthetically it is significant for the streetscape elements and forms, patterns of massing, architectural elements from the 1880s to the 1940s, as well as views to parkland both north and south.

History

The Leopold Street Sub-precinct is situated on the large parcel of land originally purchased in 1849 by HW Mason who built a house on the site adjacent to *Maritimo* on the large allotment to the east.³ It became known the Mason Estate when purchased on Mason's death by his wealthy neighbour Thomas Payne and then shortly after acquired by the Emerald Hill estate agent W P Buckhurst. That part of the land that now comprises the east side of Park Street and both sides of Leopold Street was subdivided in 1884. The land in the subdivision was then sold by Buckhurst in December 1884 to fund the construction of his mansion, *Goodrest*, which was designed by his architect son W Buckhurst, and stood, together with extensive grounds, on the large parcel of land reserved for that purpose which extended approximately two thirds of the length of the east side of Leopold Street from Gardiner's Creek Road (Toorak Road) to Domain Road. The street was named after Queen Victoria's eighth child, who died of Haemophilia in 1884 aged 31. The street provided a continuous link between the Royal Botanic Gardens and Fawkner Park. The larger house served the respectable elite, while the smaller cottages served the working classes, and providing housing for servants for the mansions of this area.

The main development era was during the real estate boom of the late eighteen eighties, on the subdivision of the east side of Park Street, and the east side of Leopold Street which was not within the *Goodrest* grounds. The depression of the 1890s stopped further development until the early 1900s, and the subsequent development of the street did not occur until the end of the interwar period. The gradual sale of the *Goodrest* land on the east side led the construction of apartments at a similar time to the construction of Interwar apartments in Marne Street.

³ Kearney and Cox, op. cit.

MARNE STREET SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The Marne Street subdivision including Toorak Road and Domain Road frontages. It was developed in two main stages after the 1919 and 1928 subdivisions of *Maritimo*. It attracted very wealthy house owners and apartment occupiers.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the Inter-war design of the whole street representing a large number of luxury flats and houses of a related design, rare for Melbourne for a single street;
- the number of flats and houses designed by notable architects;
- the diversity of the building stock from single houses to large apartment blocks from the 1920s to the 1940s, all of which contributes to the heritage value of the street, and which are generally sympathetic in terms of their architectural form, scale, and siting;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms, buildings with strong horizontal elements and unrelieved walls are the exception i.e. *Yarralumla*;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated frontage and side setbacks, and provide a richly textured presentation to the street;
- importance of setback variations revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including oblique views across adjacent properties;
- the fenestration of contributory and significant building is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are no buildings with large areas of undivided glass;
- hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and terracotta tiles;
- unpainted brickwork;
- the retention of sympathetic low front fences to contributory and significant buildings;
- the different character of the northern 1919 subdivision and southern 1928 subdivisions of *Maritimo*, with a difference in the rhythm, scale and design character, the 1928 subdivision has a pronounced rhythm of two and three storey buildings, generally located in pairs;
- the manner in which the 1928 subdivision and Interwar flats extends into Toorak Road West;
- the contributory and significant buildings are two and three storey buildings, apart from Castle Towers being five storeys;
- mature and intact landscaping to some properties;
- mature street trees in central section of street;
- views to large Bunya Pines in Fawkner Park;
- the integrity of much of the street is high, other the blocks redeveloped since the 1950s at the northern end; and,
- the integrity of most contributory and significant flats and houses is high, most survive largely unaltered and the area is notable for the absence of prominent additions and alterations.

How is it significant?

The Marne Street Sub-precinct is of historical architectural and aesthetic significance to Melbourne, and the state of Victoria.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Marne Street Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing development for the wealthy in the Inter-war period. It also demonstrates the manner in which large mansion allotments of the 1850s were redeveloped, and how these were set adjacent to areas of working class housing.

Architecturally it is significant for the number of major apartment buildings designed by important interwar architects including, Joseph Plottell, Edward Billson, Arthur Plaisted, and Robert Hamilton. There is also a number of single residential buildings of a comparable architectural character, with architects including

Marcus Martin and Mortimer McMillan. These buildings represent a wide range of styles, and Marne Street is among the most significant precincts in Melbourne for Inter-war architecture.

Marne Street is also regarded as Melbourne's most important 'deluxe' Interwar flats precinct.⁴ There are other precincts with more cohesion of form and design, such as Garden Court, East Melbourne, and the Lawson flats along Alexandra Avenue, as well as parts of Elwood, but these were for a different and less affluent market. It is of a much higher architectural standard than Fairlie Court and St Leonards Close, which both run off Anderson Street, as well as being far more intact.

This street is unique for the number of Interwar luxury flat developments and for their richness of design. It is also of note for the scale of some developments, both in plan and height. Toorak at this time was generally limited to two storey. Multi-level flats elsewhere were located in small enclaves in St Kilda and South Melbourne. In the central city *Alcaston House* provided the best example of multi-level luxury living.

Aesthetically it is significant for the manner in which the houses and flats have a strong landscape context, with front and side gardens enhanced by sections of mature street trees and distant vistas of large trees in Fawkner Park.

History and description

Marne Street subdivision comprises the whole of Crown Allotment 19. It was bought at auction by Thomas Budds Payne in 1849 who built his house there, called *Maritimo*, shown in 1855 on the Kearney plan.⁵ This house had its principal address in Toorak Road, and extended though to Domain Road. This was replaced by him in 1865, by a grand mansion also named *Maritimo*. It was designed by Charles Webb, and was subject to numerous changes in 1873, 1876, 1886 and 1903, although the front building remained.⁶ The northern part was subdivided in 1919, and the southern part in 1928 after the mansion was demolished.

The Marne Street streetscape is defined by its historical development of the *Maritimo* estate. The mansion was surrounded by a huge garden area and an open paddock extending to Toorak Road. This paddock once had a row of English Elm trees planted along some (if not all) of the west boundary to provide some form of separation from the rear yards of the closely developed and modest workers houses of Leopold Street.⁷

South Yarra was defined by such contrasts. The worker's cottages in Leopold Street, St Martin's Lane, Little Park Street and Mason Street, juxtaposed with the grand mansions, demonstrates the extreme contrast in building types and socio economic status of this affluent part of South Yarra. The small 19th century streets of South Yarra remained pockets of deprivation until the 1950s – 1960s. The rudimentary timber houses that once stood in the laneway now called Little Park Street were typical of housing targeted by slum abolitionists.⁸ By contrast Marne Street became one of the most expensive locations in Melbourne when first developed.

The significant character of Marne Street clearly reflects the *Maritimo* subdivision pattern. The northern paddock at the rear of the mansion was subdivided in 1918-19, allowing the mansion to be kept for a few more years. The first part of the Marne Street subdivision faced Domain Road. A road named after the World War 1 battle was cut through the centre and the land on both sides was sold for building. The mansion was demolished and the southern part was sub divided in 1928, with the road extending through to Toorak Road.

The 1919 northern subdivision established the future character of Marne Street. Two new major flat developments set the character for the new high density flat developments that were to take place over

⁴ Goad, Philip, University of Melbourne, Grow, Robin, Society Art Deco, and Terry Sawyer, pers. comm., to N. Lewis 5 June 2012

⁵ Kearney, op. cit.

⁶ Melbourne Mansions Database, Miles Lewis, 27 June 1997

⁷ MMBW plan 898, 1895

⁸ *ibid.*

the next 20 odd years.⁹ The 1919 *Garden Court Flats*, designed by J Plottell remains at 61 Marne Street on the north west corner of Marne Street and Domain Road. It was built next to another major block of luxury flats, *Mayfair*, built 1919,¹⁰ located at 43-45, 47-49 and 51-53 Marne Street.¹¹ It was demolished in the 1950s. These two pioneer suburban flat developments introduced a standard of new concept of luxury flats and that were noted for with a high standard of luxuriousness and for services, which included communal dining rooms.¹²

A later major development was *Moore Abbey* at 50-56 Marne Street, built in 1934, and designed by Robert B Hamilton. He was the architect of many distinguished houses and flat developments in the English vernacular, many in Toorak, and most notably *Denby Dale*, Kooyong in 1938.

The 1928 subdivision, which now covers most of Marne Street, was developed with a different overall character, with a greater concentration of large apartments complexes, counter-poised by large houses in a rhythmic pattern. By 1932 Marne Court had been built on the east side, as were single-family houses at 6 and 24. On the west side *Maritimo* flats and *Mandeville* flats were completed, as were single-family houses as Nos 3, 23, and 27.¹³

The Toorak Road frontage of the 1928 subdivision provides a prominent and well-defined gateway to Marne Street with the four allotments being developed with three storey flat developments. These also help provide an important aspect of the identity of this unique subdivision. There are two separate developments on the west, including *Maritimo* on the corner allotment at 1 Marne Street. Built in 1930, and designed by Edward F. Billson in a restrained and elegant Mediterranean style, it represents a more commercial idiom in contrast to his Prairie style buildings influenced by working for Walter Burley Griffin and Marion Mahoney.¹⁴ There is a simple modern new wing at the northern end. It is fortunate that this addition acts to balance the massing of *Yarralumla* opposite. The adjacent flats to the west at 128-130 Toorak Road West are of a similar style, and are presumably also by Billson, and graded A. On the Allotments 3 and 4 on the other corner, the complex of flats called *Yarralumla* were built in 1939. They have entrances at 138 Toorak Road West and 144 Toorak Road West on the Toorak Road frontage, and entrances at 2 Marne Street and 4 Marne Street on the Marne Street frontage. The Moderne style provides a dramatic contrast with the Revival styles of Marne Street, as well as for being built to both street frontages. This dramatic and innovative development was designed by Scarborough Robertson and Love.¹⁵ This firm had previously undertaken outstanding work at Scotch College in the 1930s. John F.D. Scarborough later established his own practice which designed the Baillieu Library in the 1950s, and a number of other architecturally significant university libraries.¹⁶

The next two allotments to the north on both sides of Marne Street have two storey buildings. *Whyalla* at 3-5 Marne Street is a grand city mansion, designed in an elegant spare Mediterranean style typical of Marcus Martin, but more ornamented in its detailing. Next door is the duplex *Oakhurst* at 7-9 Marne Street. There are flats at 6 Marne Street, built for Frank Stapley, and an interesting duplex at 8-10 Marne Street, designed by A. Mortimer McMillan.¹⁷ It is a spare, unadorned building with simple massing and a projecting central wing with an upper level balcony on the left hand side. Mortimer McMillan designed the

⁹ Sawyer, Terry, 'Residential Flats in Melbourne The Development of a Building type to 1950' Research Report, School of Architecture, University of Melbourne, 1982, p. 108

¹⁰ Sawyer Vol 2 figure 14

¹¹ Airspy view Fig ??

¹² Sawyer p 67

¹³ Sands & MacDougall Directories, 1931, 1932

¹⁴ Sawyer, Terry, 'Residential Flats in Melbourne The Development of a Building type to 1950' Research Report, School of Architecture, University of Melbourne, 1982, p. 68

¹⁵ Grow, Robin, research: Yarralumla – The Herald 14/2/40 lists the builders as General Construction P/L; 24 flats; no architect listed; includes sketch; the RVIA Journal May 1939 p. 72 shows the same sketch and lists the architects as Scarborough Robertson & Love; also PROV plans and records.

¹⁶ Ken Atkins and Barry Axtens http://baillieu50.unimelb.edu.au/history/architects_story#john (written to mark the 50th anniversary of the library).

¹⁷ Sawyer, Terry, 'Residential Flats in Melbourne The Development of a Building type to 1950' Research Report, School of Architecture, University of Melbourne, 1982, p. 107

outstanding modernist house on the south-east corner of Toorak and Hopetoun Roads that has been compared to some of the best 1920s European Modern designs.¹⁸

These two storey houses and flats make a counterpoint for the next allotments on both sides of the street further north. On the west side at 11-21 Marne Street *Castle Towers* looms over the whole surrounding area, rising to five floors and extending over three allotments. It was designed by Arthur W. Plaisted and built in 1940 -41. It became famous for the architectural debate of the time involving a 22 year old Robin Boyd. He wrote:

*"It is as though a giant garbage tin had been shaken over Melbourne for about a decade and then, when it seemed that the contents had all come out, a particularly fruity sticky hunk that had been jammed in the bottom suddenly became dislodged and fell into the middle of one of the most snobbish retreats in the city."*¹⁹

What Boyd did not consider was the contribution of flats such as found in Marne Street to the development of alternative residential forms. It is ironic that in the 1950s he chose to return to this 'snobby retreat' when he built his second house in Walsh Street, and designed Domain Towers nearby in 1963.

Across the road from *Castle Towers* at 12-16 Marne Street is *Marne Close*. This is a symmetrical pair of three storey Art Deco flats with a central driveway. It was built in 1939 by the General Construction Company.²⁰ At 20-22 Marne Street is Cromer, a two storey duplex. Further north is a group of two storey interwar houses on the next two allotments on both sides. On the west is 27 Marne Street (*Two Birches*). This is a roughcast Arts and Crafts style two storey house. Opposite at 24-26 Marne Street is a two storey house, and another at 28 Marne Street, Balmoral.

The next three allotments mark the northern end of the 1928 subdivision. There is a pair of three storey flats on the west side. *Montalto* at 31-33 Marne Street, designed by Edward Billson,²¹ it was built in 1932. This block of six flats is notable for its form, massing and decorative brickwork, but is hard to reconcile with his restrained *Maritimo* and his Prairie School houses. Mandeville at 35-37 Marne Street, and has a strong relationship with *Montalto*.

On the opposite side is *Marnot*, three storey flats at 32 Marne Street. Like *Yarralumla* and *Garden Court*, they have sections built to the street frontage. This, combined with their height, gives them a very strong streetscape presence. The final Inter-war building in this subdivision on the east side is *Marne Court*, at 40-42 Marne Street. These three storey flats were built in 1929. They are a Hollywood style concoction with elements of Mediterranean excess, reminiscent of Sicily. This arises from the Islamic inspired diamond patterning of the parapet.

The integrity of much of the street is very high. One major building, *Mayfair*, has been demolished and is occupied by modern flats, while the house on the north east corner has now been separated from Marne Street by later developments. By contrast, the southern section has much greater consistency, with almost all development dating in the 1930-1945 period surviving.

¹⁸ Nigel Lewis Richard Aitken Pty Ltd City of Malvern Heritage Study, 1992 Appendix One, citation for 68 Hopetoun Road

¹⁹ *Smudges* June 1941

²⁰ South Yarra Art Deco Walk - Moderne Melbourne Walking Tours', prepared by Robin Grow, in February 2011.

²¹ Sawyer, Terry, 'Residential Flats in Melbourne The Development of a Building type to 1950' Research Report, School of Architecture, University of Melbourne, 1982, p. 103

MASON STREETS AND ST MARTINS LANE SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The 1850s subdivisions of St Martin's Lane and Park Lane, and the 1883 subdivision of Mason Street. All buildings from the 1850s to the 1940s, and the extant historic development pattern.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the distinctive street pattern with the 1850s St Martin's Lane, Randall Place and Little Park Street linking Park Street with Milswyn Street, and the manner in which they cross Mason Street with significant / contributory corner buildings;
- the Victorian era and Edwardian era single storey cottages, mainly conjoined;
- the mixed use nature with small industrial buildings creating variety to the predominantly residential buildings of the sub-precinct;
- the stables at the rear of large houses and commercial buildings houses facing Milswyn Street;
- the manner in which small scale workers cottages are juxtaposed with large houses of the wealthy in nearby streets;
- the combined overall architectural and streetscape values of the 1850s era to the Inter-war era;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the 1880s – early 1900s terrace housing;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and slate tiles;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are no buildings with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- the integrity of some sequences in both streets is relatively high; and
- bluestone kerbs and channels.

How is it significant?

The Mason Street and St Martin's Lane Sub-precinct is of local historical and aesthetic significance.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Mason Street and St Martin's Lane Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing development from the 1850s to the 1920s.

Aesthetically it is significant for its unusual layout and small scale streetscapes.

History and description

Park Street, Milswyn Street, St Martin's Lane and Little Park Street were created in the early 1850s. By 1855 worker's housing had been developed in St Martin's Lane and Little Park Street. There was no north-south street between Park Street, and Milswyn Street at that time,²² or even by 1864.²³

St Martins's Lane has a combination of building types, with contributory 19th century single storey houses and two storey terraces, juxtaposed with two Inter-war stables / motor garages. The large brick St Martin's Youth Theatre provides a foreground to the former Maples multi-storey warehouse building behind it, and add further variety to the streetscape. There is a single storey gateway cottage on the Park

²² Kearny, op. cit.

²³ Cox, op. cit.

Street corner, until recently mirrored by a similar cottage of the 1860s on the north side, now replaced by one of the few really intrusive buildings in this area. Looking west are the mature street trees of Millswyn Street. Other than the foregoing building in Park Street, there are no intrusive new buildings.

Mason Street was subdivided in 1883 after the death of Henry Ward Mason who owned the land and buildings between Mason and Park Streets.²⁴ It is a small, narrow, one-way street running mostly north-south. The housing in the street was built to accommodate workers employed in the large houses and/or the local businesses which developed in the area.

The eastern side of the street is predominantly intact, with single-story weatherboard or brick cottages built during the 1880s and 1890s. A local builder, Charles Coulson, was responsible for building seven wooden cottages between 56 and 82 Mason Street in 1887. Two years later (1889) he built another seven brick terraces in the spaces between the original seven. These are all still relatively intact although several of the wooden houses have been veneered in brick and some have had a rear second story added.

The western side is made up of a few similar cottages. The remainder of the western side is made up of the rear of houses in Millswyn Street. There are several stables and outhouses of the wealthy and the commercial buildings at the north end. The two story Inter-war block of flats is also contributory. The intersections with 1850s St Martin's Lane, Randall Place and Little Park Street add to the significance, with contributory buildings on some corners.

The streetscape is enhanced by early bluestone kerbs and pitched roadways that cross it, and the mature Chinese Elms.

The overall integrity of this narrow quiet tree-lined street remains intact and a unique example of small workers cottages built in the 1880's. The only intrusive property is the parking area at the rear of flats in Park Street.

²⁴ L. Oscar Slater "Walking Tour of South Yarra West" p. 31

MILSWYN STREET SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The 1850s Milswyn Street subdivision including Domain Road and Toorak Road frontages. All buildings from the 1850s to the 1940s, and the extant historic development pattern. This includes several small laneways connecting to Hope Street and to Mason Street, St Martin's Lane and Park Street.

The manner in which 133 Domain Road provides a physical and historic bookend to Domain Road, as do the large 19th century house houses facing Toorak Road West.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the mixed commercial and residential nature of buildings dating up to the 1940s;
- the wide variety of housing type ranging from the grand freestanding house at 56-62 to the small conjoined workers cottages;
- the former shops, bakery and hotel;
- the Victorian, Edwardian and Inter-war building stock;
- the combined overall architectural and streetscape values of the 1850s era to the post Federation era;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the 1880s – early 1900s terrace housing;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and slate tiles;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are no buildings with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- bluestone kerbs and channels;
- mature street trees; and
- views looking north to the Botanic Gardens south to Fawkner Park.

How is it significant?

The Milswyn Street Sub-precinct is of local historical and aesthetic significance.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Milswyn Street Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing and the commercial development of South Yarra from the 1850s to the 1940s.

Aesthetically it is significant for its architectural variety and mature street trees.

History and description

The street dates from the 1850s, and was one of the most developed streets in South Yarra by 1855,²⁵ with numerous buildings on small allotments. It became the commercial hub for this part of South Yarra. It was a more important shopping area than Domain Road, and had 'three

²⁵ Kearney, op. cit.

grocers, two butchers, two greengrocers, a milk bar and a Chinese laundry' at one stage.²⁶ There was also a hotel, the large Wimmera Bakery, and a chemist. The St Martin's church hall and the large Maples warehouse behind it added further diversity to the residential sections of the street. The only commercial use today is the corner building at 133 Domain Road, all others being converted to residential use.

The houses were built for all social classes. There is a substantial legacy from the 19th century, comprising a large freestanding mansion, two storey terrace houses, and smaller single storey free standing houses and conjoined cottages. This diversity continued into the 20th century with conjoined single storey Edwardian houses, and two storey Inter-war flats.

The street has a diverse character with the former two storey commercial buildings built to the street frontage, contrasting with houses with front, and in some cases, side gardens. The streetscape is enhanced by mature street trees, and bluestone kerbs and channels as well as pitched laneways. These laneways provide links with Hope and Mason Street and St Martin's lane though to Park Street. One has an arched carriageway built as part of the bakery.

The street trees help de-emphasise the intrusive flats and other buildings built since the 1950s. These are generally in groups which has allowed the contributory and significant building stock to form coherent streetscapes and to set the character for the street.

The street provides vistas to the Botanic Gardens and Fawkner Park.

²⁶ pers. comm. To M. Butcher, Mrs M. Webber, born at 105 Milswyn Street in 1908, and daughter one of the grocers

PARK STREET SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The 1850s and 1880s Park Street subdivisions including Domain Road and Toorak Road frontages. All buildings from the 1850s to the 1940s, and the extant historic development pattern.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the Victorian era housing which define the Melbourne land boom, in particular many large two storey terraces, emphasised by basement levels on the west side and raised plinths on the east;
- the American Romanesque styled large two storey terrace houses, and single storey Edwardian terrace houses;
- the Interwar apartments, mainly three storeys, but also two storeys and one five storeys;
- the rich combined overall architectural and streetscape values of the 1880s era, the post Federation era and the Interwar era, and the manner in which the later periods are respectful of the 1880s terrace housing;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- the importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the 1880s – early 1900s terrace housing;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and slate tiles;
- most contributory and significant buildings have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are none with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- the integrity of the eastern side of the street is relatively high;
- bluestone kerbs and channels; and
- views looking north to the Botanic Gardens south to Fawkner Park.

How is it significant?

The Park Street Sub-precinct is of historical, architectural and aesthetic significance to Melbourne, and the state of Victoria.

Why is it significant?

Historically the Park Street Sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of housing development for the affluent urbanised dwellers from the 1860s to the 1940s. It anticipates the role of flats in later eras.

The street is important for its architectural character, and presents a remarkable ensemble of styles and building types.

Aesthetically it is significant for its strong urban forms and views to the Botanic Gardens and Fawkner Park.

History and description

Park Street was created in the early 1850s at a similar time as Milswyn and Domain Streets to the west. Allotments were formed for substantial homes on the west side and very small allotments for workers housing were developed in St Martin's Lane and Little Park Street by

1855.²⁷ This became a pattern for the area, providing servants near to the houses of the wealthy.

The whole of the east side was part a large parcel of land originally purchased in 1849 by HW Mason and known as the Mason Estate. The Estate was purchased on Mason's death by his wealthy neighbour Thomas Payne and then shortly after acquired by the Emerald Hill estate agent W P Buckhurst. That part of the land that now comprises the east side of Park Street and both sides of Leopold Street was subdivided in 1884. As a result development was restricted to the west side for 30 years. One small 1860s house survived until recently at the corner of St Martin's Lane.

The sudden release of the prestigious land on the east side in the middle of Melbourne's land boom led to the development of a more cohesive housing type with many elaborate and imposing terrace houses with two storey verandahs and rich ornamentation. Many were given extra prominence by being set on elevated plinths. Not all of these new allotments were developed at first and many remained vacant, possibly due to land speculation before the 1890s crash. This pattern can be clearly observed today, with two 1900s developments, one a row of American Romanesque style terraces, and further developments during the Inter-war period. However, one of these Inter-war developments involved the redevelopment of a large mansion and garden on the corner block at Toorak Road. This once extended to Leopold Street. It was replaced by a large three storey Inter-war block of flats, *St Margaret's*, built in a period style with a turret of a French medieval revival design.

On the west side, by contrast, the redevelopment of the large allotments occurred in various stages to create an eclectic range of housing types. The 1850s housing stock was largely swept away by the 1880s land boom. There was an unusual group of boarding houses and private hotels built from the 1880s until the 1920s. They had basement levels creating a third floor, made possible by the fall of the land. Most were built in the high Victorian boom style with elaborate cast iron balconies, although there is one in a Classical Revival style and another Art Nouveau. The American Romanesque style was also employed on the west side. Among the developers who made their mark on Park Street was Elias Cunliff, a prosperous jam maker and grocer.

In the Inter-war period a number of flats and apartments were built on the west side. They adopted a range of styles and forms. On the at the west corner with Toorak Road two highly articulated Moderne blocks of flats were built, a narrow five storey block next to Little Park Street, and a Hollywood - Mediterranean style was used for *Guilford*. A cohesive sequence of large two and three storey Inter-war apartments was built just north of St Martin's Lane extending to the shops at the corner of Domain Road.

The significance of designs by Inter-war architects such as Frank Stapley and Arthur Plaisted add to the importance of the both streetscapes. The varied architectural styles are held together by general uniformity of height, scale and character so that the whole is visually cohesive and historically interesting. It demonstrates an evolving contributory character streetscape over 90 years.

Park Street is a unique historical urban thoroughfare linking the Botanic Gardens and Fawkner Park. The number 8 tram adds to its highly urbanised character.

The 1930s depression and the Second World War led to the private hotels and flats becoming run-down boarding houses and terrace houses were converted into rooms or flats. This process has been in reverse over the last 30 years. The integrity of the east side of Park Street is very high, with the exception of the construction of the 20 storey Park Towers in 1962, and a new house at 98 Park Street. On the west side there are two blocks of three storey 1950s blocks of utilitarian flats. More recently the four storey block on the corner has dramatically altered the single storey scale of the east end of St Martin's Lane.

²⁷ Kearney, op. cit.

PASLEY STREET, PARK PLACE AND PUNT ROAD SUB-PRECINCT

What is significant?

The 1860s subdivisions of Pasley Street and Park Place extending to Punt Road. They form a linear stretch of mostly residential development located along the east side of Fawkner Park, and include the original church reservations.

Elements which contribute to the significance of the sub-precinct include (but are not limited to):

- the variety of Victorian era housing, ranging from grand freestanding houses, large terrace houses and substantial detached single storey villas facing Fawkner Park, and the small conjoined workers cottages facing Punt Road;
- several Inter-war blocks of flats;
- the manner in which the scale and forms of the Victorian and Inter-war building stock frames and enhances Fawkner Park;
- the relationship of Park Place with historic church buildings;
- the fine grain nature of the streetscape pattern;
- the importance of oblique views revealing side walls and three dimensional nature of contributory and significant buildings, including views across adjacent properties;
- the consistent heights, setbacks and building forms of the Victorian housing stock;
- parapeted, hipped or gabled roofscapes with chimneys and slate tiles;
- most contributory and significant building have articulated building forms comprising smaller elements, many with angled roof forms;
- fenestration of contributory and significant building that is highly articulated, whether as openings in masonry, or by framing, there are none with large areas of undivided glass;
- unpainted masonry walls;
- the integrity of the sub-precinct is relatively high except at the southern end of Pasley Street;
- mature street trees;
- bluestone kerbs and channels; and
- views across Fawkner Park.

How is it significant?

The Pasley Street and Park Place Sub-precinct is of local historical and aesthetic significance.

Why is it significant?

Pasley Street, Park Place and the adjoining allotments in Punt Road are primarily significant as they reinforce the historical integrity of Fawkner Park. The scale and character of the housing in these two streets relates to the landscape character of Fawkner Park.

Historically the sub-precinct is significant for its ability to demonstrate important phases of the creation of parkland in Melbourne from the 1840s to the 1860s.

Aesthetically it is significant for the interrelation of the mature trees of the park with the relatively intact streetscapes.

History and description

First set aside by Charles La Trobe, the parkland originally extended from Toorak Road to St Kilda Junction, and from Albert Park Lake to Punt Road, with some reservations for churches and sporting grounds by 1855.²⁸ Established in 1862, Fawkner Park is one of the oldest and largest parks in Melbourne and it is still largely unchanged after the alienation of land along its

²⁸ Kearney, op. cit.

eastern and western boundaries in the 1860s. This was claimed to be a money raising measure and generated much public debate. A large subdivision for private housing was originally proposed within the north and east boundaries of the Fawkner Park. The northern section of this 'alienation of land' did not go ahead, but the streets of Park Place and Pasley Street were created, interspersed by the existing 1850s church reservations. The subdivision created allotments facing Fawkner Park and Punt Road, and the first houses built in Park Place by 1864.²⁹

Pasley Street has a predominance of substantial Victorian single and double storey houses dating from the 1870s to the 1890s. Park Place is similar but with two storey terraces as well as small two storey Inter-war block of flats of a similar scale, in the Moderne style. Punt Road has a predominance of single storey conjoined Victorian cottages, with several blocks of Inter-war flats.

Both Pasley Street and Park Place remain streetscapes that are largely intact. The view from Fawkner Park to these streets strongly demonstrates La Trobe's vision for a city surrounded by parklands. Pasley Street has elm trees on the house-side verge that balance with the elm trees directly opposite in the park. Park Place, in contrast, has an unobstructed lawn vista through mature tall palm trees towards the striking row of dwellings.

The integrity of the sub-precinct is relatively high, other than for the southern end of Pasley Street. There are only two other intrusive flat developments in Pasley Street, the three storey block at 40-42 is relatively benign due to the scale and setback. However the tall four storey block at 52 is extremely intrusive as it also projects well forward of the predominant setback. Another matching block at 56 was demolished in the early 1970s due to a court order. There are several non-intrusive modern houses. Park Place is relatively intact other than the new town houses next to the Inter-war flats. There are several modern blocks of flats in Punt Road.

²⁹ Cox, *op. cit.*