

Review of Punt Road

Public Acquisition Overlay

Background Report

August 2015





Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Terms of Reference	5
3.	History (1900s)	6
4.	Land Use & Transport Planning (Post 2000)	11
4.1.	Melbourne 2030	11
4.2.	Plan Melbourne – Metropolitan Planning Strategy	12
5.	Legislative and Policy Frameworks	14
5.1.	Legislative Framework	14
5.2.	Transport Integration Act 2010	14
5.3.	Planning and Environment Act 1987	14
5.4.	State Planning Policy Framework	15
5.5.	Clause 45.01 Stonnington Planning Scheme - Public Acquisition Overlay	16
5.6.	Commonwealth Advice - Infrastructure Australia	17
6.	Current Alignment and Land Use Context	18
6.1.	Mapping of the Public Acquisition Overlay	18
6.2.	Property Issues	20
6.3.	Current Planning Controls, Land Use & Built Form	22
7.	Current and Future Road Configuration Options	23
7.1.	Current Configuration	23
7.2.	Future Configuration Options within Existing Road Reserve	23
7.2.1.	Managing Parking and Right Turns	23
7.2.2.	Five Lane Treatment	24
7.3.	Future Configuration Options outside Existing Road Reserve	25
8.	Discussion	27
8.1.	Melbourne's Population Growth & Transport Challenge	27
8.2.	Role of Punt Road - Hoddle Street in Melbourne's Transport Network	27
8.3.	Ongoing role of Punt Road	28
8.4.	Connecting communities and providing better links	28
8.5.	SmartRoads Framework	29



8.6.	Traffic	31
8.7.	Public Transport	32
8.8.	Walking and Cycling	35
9.	Summary of Advantages and Disadvantages of Retaining or Removing PAO	37
9. 9.1.	Summary of Advantages and Disadvantages of Retaining or Removing PAO Advantages of Retaining the PAO	37 37

Figures

Figure 1: Punt Road - Hoddle Street Corridor	1
Figure 2: Punt Road Corridor	3
Figure 3: Locality Plan of Punt Road Public Acquisition Overlay, Stonnington Planning Scheme	4
Figure 4: 1929 General Roads Scheme for Melbourne	7
Figure 5: 1954 Proposed Arterial Road System for Melbourne	8
Figure 6: 1969 Proposed Freeway Network for Melbourne	9
Figure 7: Current Freeway and Arterial Road Network in Melbourne and Nearby Regional Areas	10
Figure 8: Extract of Map 23 from Plan Melbourne showing Principal Freight Network	13
Figure 9: Existing Punt Road PAO Alignment and Property Lots	18
Figure 10: Public Acquisition Overlay (in blue) on west side of Punt Road in City of Port Phillip	19
Figure 11: Land shown in green forms part of Punt Road reserve	19
Figure 12: Indicative Cross Section Between Alexandra Avenue and Toorak Road	24
Figure 13: Indicative Cross Section Between Toorak Road and Commercial Road	24
Figure 14: Indicative Cross Section Between Commercial Road and High Street	25
Figure 15: Indicative Cross Section Between High Street and Union Road	25
Figure 16: Indicative Cross Sections for Divided Six Lane Road within 40 Metre Road Reserve	26
Figure 17: Current local public transport routes in the vicinity of Punt Road	34

Tables

Table 1: VicRoads Properties and Leasing Status	20
Table 2: Smart Roads Road Use Hierarchy for Key Roads	30
Table 3: Traffic Volumes along Punt Road, over Time	32

DISCLAIMER:

Due to the fast-tracked timeframe for the preparation of this Background Report, this report is preliminary. There are a range of options for Punt Road and associated issues that require detailed investigation.

VicRoads is also preparing an Options Report that will expand on this initial Background Report by including traffic modelling and projections for various future options along Punt Road. The Options Report is expected to be completed and available later this year

1. Introduction

The Punt Road - Hoddle Street corridor in inner Melbourne, shown in Figure 1, is a major north-south transport route from Clifton Hill in the north to St Kilda Junction in the south that provides regional access to many State significant facilities, as well as a wide range of employment, education, health, retail, recreation and other facilities.



Copyright Melway Publishing Pty Ltd 2015 - Reproduced with Permission Figure 1: Punt Road - Hoddle Street Corridor

The corridor is a complex environment, passing through a variety of precincts and neighbourhoods, and needs to respond to a range of transport and access demands, all competing for road space. It plays an important role in Melbourne's liveability, prosperity and the wellbeing of local communities.

This report focuses on the Punt Road section of the corridor south of the Yarra River (refer Figure 2) which is narrower than the section north of the River. Punt Road, from Alexandra Avenue, South Yarra to just north of Union Street, Windsor is generally a four lane undivided arterial road abutted by significant urban development. The exact road reserve (property line to property line) along this length varies from approximately 17 metres at the northern end (near Domain Road) to approximately 21 metres at the southern end (near High Street). At Union Street, Punt Road flares out to an eight lane divided arterial road within an approximate 40 metre wide road reserve.

Between the Yarra River and High Street, Punt Road forms the municipal boundary between the City of Melbourne (west side) and the City of Stonnington (east side). Between High Street and St Kilda Junction, Punt Road forms the municipal boundary between the City of Port Phillip (west side) and the City of Stonnington (east side).

The original 1954 planning scheme identified the intention to widen the east side of Punt Road between Alexandra Avenue, South Yarra and Union Street, Windsor. The current Stonnington Planning Scheme includes an approximate 20 metre wide Public Acquisition Overlay (**PAO**) along the east side of Punt Road as generally shown in Figure 3. The PAO widens out at Alexandra Avenue and narrows down approaching Union Street.

During 2010 and 2011, VicRoads undertook a preliminary study of Punt Road between Union Street and CityLink (just north of the Yarra River), involving the development of a range of possible longterm improvement options considering transport needs and road widening opportunities and constraints. The final study report dated May 2012 is attached in Appendix A.

Whilst this preliminary study was based on the land use and transport settings at that time and some of the information is now out of date, VicRoads considers that the study report provides useful reference material for the current review of the Punt Road PAO. However, it should be noted that the conclusions of the study report do not necessarily represent the current views of VicRoads, other transport agencies or the State Government.

As a result of the preliminary study, VicRoads adopted a position that the existing Punt Road PAO should be retained to preserve a long-term opportunity for a major upgrade to a six lane divided cross-section between Union Street and just north of the Yarra River. This would include widening of the Hoddle Bridge over the Yarra River and upgrade of all existing signalised intersections along this section of Punt Road.

The preliminary study also acknowledged that such an upgrade would involve very significant property and social impacts and some cultural heritage impacts, and that detailed assessment of these impacts and extensive stakeholder and community consultation would be required prior to any construction of such an upgrade.



Copyright Melway Publishing Pty Ltd 2015 - Reproduced with Permission

Figure 2: Punt Road Corridor





2. Terms of Reference

The State Government made an election commitment to establish an independent Advisory Committee to review and report on the future of the Punt Road PAO. On 17 February 2015, the Minister for Planning approved the Terms of Reference for the Punt Road PAO Advisory Committee.

In accordance with the Terms of Reference, VicRoads was requested to prepare a background report to provide base information to assist with the review, including the following:

- the history of and background to the road widening / the overlay
- detailed mapping of the overlay
- the current and projected traffic volumes for all modes of transport, including pedestrian, cyclist, car, heavy and public transport along and near Punt Road
- the current and projected regional road and transport network operation
- the current and possible future configurations of Punt Road with and without the overlay
- the current land use and built form of land subject to the overlay
- the current public transport along and crossing Punt Road
- the current planning controls
- the benefits (advantages) and costs (disadvantages) of retaining the overlay
- the benefits (advantages) and costs (disadvantages) of removing the overlay, including possible alternate road and transport network response
- whether any modifications to the overlay are necessary.

Due to the fast-tracked timeframe for the preparation of this Background Report, this report is preliminary. It does not comprehensively cover all of the above information. There are a range of future options for Punt Road and associated issues that require detailed investigation. VicRoads is preparing an Options Report that will expand on this initial Background Report by including traffic modelling and projections for the Punt Road options currently under investigation. The Options Report is expected to be completed and available later this year.

It is also noted that this is a review of the Punt Road PAO and not a detailed examination of the design, or a business case, for a future widened road within this PAO. There is no current commitment or proposal to widen the road into properties affected by this PAO, and therefore no current need or intention to compulsorily acquire any properties.

3. History (1900s)

The Punt Road corridor (or alternatives in the near vicinity) has been identified as an important corridor in transport planning in Melbourne over many decades. The following is a brief history of road transport network planning in metropolitan Melbourne with specific comments in relation to Punt Road.

The first comprehensive attempt at preparing a metropolitan wide plan for Melbourne occurred in 1929 when the then Metropolitan Town Planning Commission recommended a "General Roads Scheme" which proposed an extensive network of roads and tramways (refer Figure 4). The plan proposed a tramline on a corridor aligned partly on the current Punt Road alignment and partly on an alignment slightly to the west.

In 1954, the then body responsible for metropolitan wide land use and transport planning in Melbourne, the Melbourne and Metropolitan Board of Works (MMBW), prepared a plan setting out a network of proposed roads (refer Figure 5). Many of these proposed roads were later set out in a planning scheme that enabled the designated land required for road construction to be compulsorily acquired from its owners. The proposed routes that were set out in this planning scheme have formed the basis for much of the major freeway construction and major road widening that has since occurred in Melbourne over the past five decades. There have subsequently been some variations to the locations of some routes, route deletions and new connections to rural highways.

Punt Road between St Kilda Junction and the Yarra River (shown as Route 2) was included as part of the 'Proposed Arterial Road System' in the MMBW's plan, and was shown as 'Not having provision made to control access'. That is, Punt Road between St Kilda Junction and the Yarra River, was intended to be an arterial road with intersecting roads and adjoining properties having access. It was not intended to be a freeway, which would not have access to other roads or adjoining properties other than via interchanges.

Other sections of roads that feed into or are fed by this section of Punt Road have been constructed or widened over decades, including:

- Queens Way / Dandenong Road between Union Street and Hornby Street, Windsor part new road and part widening (undertaken late 1960s)
- Punt Road between Union Street and St Kilda Junction road widening
- St Kilda Road (formerly High Street) between St Kilda Junction and Carlisle Street, Balaclava – road widening (undertaken early to mid 1970s)
- Nepean Highway between Cochrane Street, Gardenvale and South Road, Moorabbin road widening (undertaken late 1970s)
- Hoddle Street between Eastern Freeway and Victoria Parade road widening (undertaken early to mid 1970s, prior to opening of the Eastern Freeway from Hoddle Street to Bulleen Road)
- Hoddle Street between Victoria Parade and south of Albert Street road widening (undertaken in late 1970s)
- Punt Road between Bridge Road and Swan Street road widening (undertaken 1980s)

In 1969, a body entitled the Metropolitan Transport Committee prepared a recommended transport plan for Melbourne. This transport plan included proposals for approximately 300 miles (500 kilometres) of freeways (refer Figure 6), together with proposals for railway and tramway improvements.

A freeway ("F2") was proposed in the general vicinity of the Punt Road - Hoddle Street corridor crossing Melboune from the outer north to the outer south east. The implementation of this freeway network would have resulted in very extensive property acquisition, severance and adverse environmental effects. Such was the level of public concern, having regard to factors such as fuel shortages in the 1970s, reaction to property acquisition and neighbourhood severance, and

preferences for public transport, that many reservations for future freeways were deleted from planning schemes, or were not proceeded with, particularly in established areas, where large scale property acquisition would have been required. Reservations for freeways were retained in what were then outer areas, where the reservations had been applied largely, but not entirely, prior to urban development, with a consequent relatively lesser impact on homes. In some cases, these reservations in outer areas were subsequently modified or relocated as a result of an increased focus on environmental and heritage values than previously. Consequently, while the retained or modified reservations for the outer portions of roads in the freeway corridor shown as F2 have enabled construction (Hume Freeway north of M80 – Western Ring Road, constructed; and Dingley Arterial between Warrigal Road and South Gippsland Highway, partly constructed and partly under construction), the proposed inner sections of the F2, including the section in the vicinity of Punt Road between the Yarra River and Union Street, Windsor, have never proceeded.



Figure 4: 1929 General Roads Scheme for Melbourne



Figure 5: 1954 Proposed Arterial Road System for Melbourne



Figure 6: 1969 Proposed Freeway Network for Melbourne

Over subsequent decades, freeway and arterial road construction was undertaken in established and amended reservations, both by Government agencies funded from taxation revenue, and, in the case of certain freeways, by the private sector under Public Private Partnership arrangements whereby either motorists are charged tolls for road usage, or most recently, payment of an availability charge for the private sector to provide the road for public use. Figure 7 shows the current freeway and arterial road network in Melbourne and its regional hinterland.



Figure 7: Current Freeway and Arterial Road Network in Melbourne and Nearby Regional Areas

4. Land Use & Transport Planning (Post 2000)

4.1. Melbourne 2030

"Melbourne 2030" was released in 2002 as the planning strategy for the future growth of Melbourne over a 30 year horizon. Key aspects of this planning strategy were:

- Better management of urban growth, including establishment of a legislated Urban Growth Boundary to control the growth of urbanization
- Better Transport Links with an increased emphasis on the use of public transport, walking and cycling. This direction also comprised continued investment in the road system to meet freight and mobility needs. The focus for the freeway network was on the completion of EastLink and connecting the metropolitan and regional Victorian freeway networks.

By 2005, it had become apparent that there was growing congestion on the existing freeway network and also that there was a potential need to plan for major new transport corridors to serve metropolitan Melbourne and surrounding areas. In 2006 the *"Meeting our Transport Challenges"* transport strategy was released, which identified the need, inter alia, to plan for future public transport networks and major road and transport corridors that would *"make the delivery of future transport infrastructure faster, more timely and cost-effective when it is finally required."*

In 2008, revised population forecasts, "*Victoria in Future*", and two updated planning and transport strategies were released - *"Melbourne 2030: a planning update – Melbourne @ 5 million"*, and *"The Victorian Transport Plan"*. High levels of immigration, a higher birth-rate, and longer life expectancy resulted in population projections for Melbourne being revised significantly upwards.

Melbourne @ 5 *million* identified that the growth of Melbourne to a population of 5 million people requires:

- Establishing Central Activities Districts six designated centres to "the focus of a substantial proportion of future employment growth and public investment"
- Developing employment corridors three employment corridors that "link activity centres, universities, research and technology precincts, medical precincts and areas with high employment"
- Reviewing the urban growth boundary to provide for over 284,000 new homes by enabling additional land to be developed for residential and employment opportunities outside the current urban growth boundary.

The importance of the section of the Hoddle Street - Punt Road corridor between the Eastern Freeway and City Link in Richmond was recognised in *The Victorian Transport Plan* which identified the need to plan for a range of transport projects, including:

• "Commence engineering investigations to determine the feasibility of grade separating key junctions along Hoddle Street"

4.2. Plan Melbourne – Metropolitan Planning Strategy

The *Plan Melbourne - Metropolitan Planning Strategy* was released in 2014. It outlines the strategy for managing Melbourne's growth and change to the year 2050.

The current Government has committed to refreshing *Plan Melbourne*. It has flagged a transparent and consultative review process to produce a renewed Plan Melbourne that provides the long-term vision for Victoria's growing population. This will include identifying further housing opportunities and alternatives, increasing jobs and improving liveability, dealing with a changing climate, integrating public transport and supporting infrastructure investment.

Where relevant, planning and responsible authorities must consider and apply the *Plan Melbourne* strategy (Clause 9.01 of State Planning Policy Framework).

Seven key outcomes and associated objectives were developed to underpin the Strategy, as follows:

- **"Delivering jobs and investment:** create a city structure that drives productivity, supports innovation and creates more jobs"
- "Housing Choice and affordability: Provide a diversity of housing in defined locations that cater for different households and are close to jobs and services"
- **"A more connected Melbourne:** Provide an integrated transport system connecting people to jobs and services, and goods to market."
- *"Liveable communities and neighbourhoods:* Create healthy and active neighbourhoods and maintain Melbourne's identity as one of the world's most liveable cities"
- **"Environment and water:** Protect our natural assets and better plan our water, energy and waste management systems to create a sustainable city."
- **"A State of Cities:** Maximise the growth potential of Victoria by developing a State of Cities which delivers choice, opportunity and global competitiveness."
- *"Implementation: Delivering better governance*: Achieve clear results through better governance, planning, regulation and funding mechanisms"

"A More Connected Melbourne" includes "Direction 3.2 – Improve Access to Job-Rich Areas across Melbourne and Strengthen Transport Networks in Existing Suburbs". Under this direction is Initiative 3.2.4 "Develop the Road System in the suburbs to improve connections across Melbourne". Improvement to Punt Road would be compatible with this direction, as it would improve access to job-rich areas in the Cities of Yarra, Melbourne, Stonnington and Port Phillip that surround the Melbourne Central Business District.

"A More Connected Melbourne" also includes "Direction 3.5 – Improve the Efficiency of Freight Networks while Protecting Urban Amenity". Figure 8 below is an extract of Map 23 from *Plan Melbourne* which shows a Principal Freight Network, of roads and rail, including the Hoddle Street - Punt Road corridor from the Eastern Freeway to St Kilda Junction.



MAP 23 - FREIGHT NETWORKS AND GATEWAYS BY 2050

SOURCE: DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND LOCAL INFRASTRUCTURE, 2014

- Metropolitan region Metropolitan urban boundary 10000 Urban area Road network Rail network Principal Freight Network – rail Principal Freight Network – road Bulk port ٠ Container port • Interstate freight terminal (indicative location) Metropolitan intermodal system terminal [indicative location] Airport initiative -Intermodal terminal precincts Port initiative Airport × Seaport ÷ Key industrial precinct
- SERL South-East Rail Link
- OMR Outer Metropolitan Road

Figure 8: Extract of Map 23 from Plan Melbourne showing Principal Freight Network

5. Legislative and Policy Frameworks

5.1. Legislative Framework

The key legislative frameworks for transport and land use planning in Victoria are the *Transport Integration Act 2010* and the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*, which are outlined below.

A range of other Acts of Parliament, for example, the *Road Management Act 2004* and the *Road Safety Act 1986* are relevant to particular aspects of road governance.

5.2. Transport Integration Act 2010

The *Transport Integration Act 2010* sets out objectives and decision-making principles for transportrelated decisions. Decision-makers must have regard to the objectives and decision-making principles when making decisions under transport and planning legislation.

Key overarching objectives include:

- Social and economic inclusion
- Economic prosperity
- Environmental sustainability
- Integration of transport and land use
- Efficiency, coordination and reliability
- Safety, health and well-being

The decision-making principles are summarised as:

- Principle of integrated decision making
- Principle of triple bottom line assessment
- Principle of equity
- Principle of the transport system user perspective
- Principle of stakeholder engagement and community participation
- Principle of transparency

5.3. Planning and Environment Act 1987

The *Planning and Environment Act 1987* ("**P&E Act**") regulates land use planning within Victoria. The purpose of the P&E Act is *"to establish a framework for planning the use, development and protection of land in Victoria in the present and long-term interests of all Victorians"*.

The P&E Act sets out objectives of planning in Victoria as being:

- "(a) to provide for the fair, orderly, economic and sustainable use, and development of land;
- (b) to provide for the protection of natural and man-made resources and the maintenance of ecological processes and genetic diversity;
- (c) to secure a pleasant, efficient and safe working, living and recreational environment for all Victorians and visitors to Victoria;
- (d) to conserve and enhance those buildings, areas or other places which are of scientific, aesthetic, architectural or historical interest, or otherwise of special cultural value;
- (e) to protect public utilities and other assets and enable the orderly provision and co-ordination of public utilities and other facilities for the benefit of the community;
- (f) to facilitate development in accordance with the objectives set out in paragraphs (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e);
- (g) to balance the present and future interests of all Victorians."

All planning schemes, including the Stonnington, Melbourne, Port Phillip and Yarra Planning Schemes, are established under the provisions of the P&E Act, which also prescribes procedures for the amendment of planning schemes.

5.4. State Planning Policy Framework

The State Planning Policy Framework forms part of all planning schemes.

Clause 18 of the State Planning Policy Framework in relation to Transport, states:

"Planning should ensure an integrated and sustainable transport system that provides access to social and economic opportunities, facilitates economic prosperity, contributes to environmental sustainability, coordinates reliable movements of people and goods, and is safe."

Clause 18.01-2, Transport System, has as an objective:

"To coordinate development of all transport modes to provide a comprehensive transport system"

Relevant strategies under Clause 18.01-2 are:

"Reserve land for strategic transport infrastructure

Locate transport routes to achieve the greatest overall benefit to the community and with regard to making the best use of existing social, cultural and economic infrastructure, minimising impacts on the environment and optimising accessibility, safety, emergency access, service and amenity

Locate and design new transport routes and adjoining land uses to minimise disruption of residential communities and their amenity

Plan or regulate new uses or development of land near an existing or proposed transport route to avoid detriment to, and where possible enhance the service, safety and amenity desirable for that transport route in the short and long terms."

Clause 18.02-3, Principal Public Transport Network, has as an objective:

"To upgrade and develop the Principal Public Transport Network and local public transport services in Metropolitan Melbourne to connect activity centres, link activities in employment corridors and link Melbourne to the regional cities"

Relevant strategies under Clause 18.02-3 are:

"Provide a Principal Public Transport Network that allows for circumferential, in addition to radial movements

Improve the operation of the existing public transport network with faster, more reliable and efficient on-road and rail public transport by:

- Improving the movement, efficiency and reliability of the road-based public transport by road-space management measures including transit lanes, clearways, traffic light prioritisation and stop design
-

Clause 18.02-4, Management of the road system, has as an objective:

"To manage the road system to achieve integration, choice and balance by developing an efficient and safe network and making the most of existing infrastructure."

Relevant strategies under Clause 18.02-4 are:

"Make better use of roads for all road uses through such techniques as the provision of wider footpaths, bicycle lanes, transit lanes (for buses and taxis) and specific freight routes.

Selectively expand and upgrade the road network to provide for:

- •
- Upgrading of key freight routes
- ...
- Higher standards of on-road public transport
- …"

Improve the management of key freight routes to make freight operations more efficient while reducing their external impacts

Ensure that road space complements land use and is managed to meet community and business needs"

Clause 19, Infrastructure, states, inter alia:

"Growth and redevelopment of settlements should be planned in a manner that allows for the logical and efficient provision and maintenance of infrastructure, including the setting aside of land for the construction of future transport routes

Strategic planning should facilitate efficient use of existing infrastructure and human services. Providers of infrastructure, whether public or private bodies, are to be guided by planning policies and should assist strategic land use planning."

5.5. Clause 45.01 Stonnington Planning Scheme - Public Acquisition Overlay

The purpose of a Public Acquisition Overlay (PAO) is stated in Clause 45.01 of the Stonnington Planning Scheme:

"To implement the State Planning Policy Framework and the Local Planning Policy Framework, including the Municipal Strategic Statement and local planning policies."

To identify land which is proposed to be acquired by a Minister, public authority or municipal council.

To reserve land for a public purpose and to ensure that changes to the use or development of the land do not prejudice the purpose for which the land is to be acquired.

To designate a Minister, public authority or municipal council as an acquiring authority for land reserved for a public purpose."

Schedule 1 to Clause 45.01 in the Stonnington Planning Scheme specifies that the purpose of the Punt Road PAO is for road widening and that the Roads Corporation (VicRoads) is the designated acquiring authority.

Clause 45.01 stipulates the requirements for planning permits relating to the Punt Road PAO and the need for any such planning permit applications to be referred to VicRoads as the designated acquiring authority.

5.6. Commonwealth Advice - Infrastructure Australia

Infrastructure Australia in its report to the Australian Government¹, noted, in relation to *"Corridor Protection"* that:

"Decisions taken in the past, and those we make now, to preserve corridors for infrastructure development are critical to addressing issues such as traffic congestion, freight movement, water security and energy supply. For example, the M1 and EastLink in Melbourne and the M4 and M5 were developed between the 1980s and 2000s on corridors that had been reserved and protected since the 1950s and 1960s.

If we do not set aside corridors for designated uses now, we risk them being 'built out'. The result is spiralling costs – particularly in road and rail infrastructure, where tunnelling can multiply costs by around 10 times – and consequently, fewer funds for investment in other projects."

¹ Infrastructure Australia, Australian Infrastructure, Progress and Action – A Report to the Council of Australian Governments 06/12, 2012

6. Current Alignment and Land Use Context

6.1. Mapping of the Public Acquisition Overlay

Figure 9 shows the overall alignment of the existing Punt Road PAO superimposed on a plan showing property lots. Appendix B includes more detailed plans in seven sections, including aerials, showing the Punt Road PAO and property lots and addresses.



Figure 9: Existing Punt Road PAO Alignment and Property Lots

Whilst the Terms of Reference for the Punt Road PAO Advisory Committee relate to the PAO on the east side of Punt Road within the City of Stonnington, there is also a sliver of Public Acquisition Overlay affecting land on the west side of Punt Road in the City of Port Phillip in the vicinity of Raleigh Street, as shown in the detailed plans in Appendix B and Figure 10 below.



Figure 10: Public Acquisition Overlay (in blue) on west side of Punt Road in City of Port Phillip

This Public Acquisition Overlay affects the Raleigh Street road reserve, a small portion of land at 101 Punt Road, Windsor and the land shown in green in Figure 11 below which already forms part of the road reserve of Punt Road and is zoned Road Zone Category 1 in the Port Phillip Planning Scheme.

Figure 11: Land shown in green forms part of Punt Road reserve

6.2. **Property Issues**

The Punt Road PAO affects approximately 140 properties, with most of these properties comprising residential development. The majority of the buildings on these properties are affected by the PAO.

VicRoads owns 22 of the 140 properties within the Punt Road PAO (refer Table 1). These 22 properties have been progressively acquired over time by the State from about 1960 to 1980 when the last property was acquired. These properties were acquired by the Melbourne Metropolitan Board of Works with responsibility for their management transferred to VicRoads by 1989.

Property Address	Planning Scheme Zoning	Leased	Current land use
	<u> </u>		Mostly vacant with small part leased as
520 Punt Rd South Yarra	General Residential	Part	driveway access to apartments at rear
506 Punt Rd South Yarra	General Residential	Yes	Single house leased as site office
504A Punt Rd South Yarra	General Residential	Yes	Private car park (use by residents of units at 504 Punt Rd)
1-5/462 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Residential
456 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Stonnington public car park
450 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Residential and artist studio
1-2/446-448 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Residential
442 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Stonnington public car park
440 Pupt Rd South Varra	Posidential Growth	Voc	Leased to adjacent Owners Corporation for private use as garden area associated with a toppic court
	Residential Growth	res	
438 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	private use as a tennis court and garden
436 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Leased to adjacent Owners Corporation for private use as a tennis court and garden
434 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Leased to adjacent Owners Corporation for private use as a tennis court and garden
432 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Leased to adjacent Owners Corporation for use as a private car park
382-382A Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Stonnington public car park
382 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Stonnington public car park
360 Punt Rd South Yarra	Neighbourhood Residential	Yes	Private car park (florist)
316 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Private car park
274 Punt Rd South Yarra	Residential Growth	Yes	Vacant land used as a short term car park for two months (July – Aug 2015)
200 Punt Rd Prahran	Residential Growth	No	Vacant land
198 Punt Rd Prahran	Residential Growth	Yes	Access to tennis court
1-5/182 Punt Rd Prahran	Residential Growth	Yes	Vacant land used as short term storage for three months (July – Sep 2015)
92 Punt Rd Windsor	Residential Growth	Yes	Residential

Table 1: VicRoads Properties and Leasing Status

For financial reporting purposes, VicRoads values its properties every five years. VicRoads recently engaged the Valuer-General Victoria to provide updated valuations of its properties and the current (2015) combined value of the 22 VicRoads properties within the Punt Road PAO is \$19 million. This represents the encumbered value of these properties with the PAO in place.

Most of these properties are leased and VicRoads receives a total net rental return of around \$150,000 per annum. The properties are currently leased for residential and commercial purposes

(refer Table 1). Some of the commercial uses include access to private property, car parking, a tennis court and an artist's studio.

One of VicRoads' properties is boarded up and requires substantial expenditure to restore it to an acceptable lettable standard pursuant to the *Residential Tenancies Act 1997*. An application by VicRoads to demolish rather than restore this property was denied by Stonnington Council, due to the property being protected by a heritage overlay and there being no imminent need to widen Punt Road and act on the PAO. The property is currently being leased to an abutting developer as a site office.

Part 5 of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987* provides for owners who owned a property prior to creation of a planning scheme reservation for road purposes that affects the property, to claim what is known as planning compensation. A PAO in a planning scheme is deemed a reservation for the purpose of planning compensation. Planning compensation can be sought in respect of a claim for "Financial Loss" arising from the refusal of a planning application as a direct result of the PAO, or through a claim for "Loss on Sale".

Planning compensation paid is recorded on the property title through a Notice recorded by the Registrar of Titles. These are either pursuant to Section 110 of the *Planning & Environment Act 1987* or its predecessor, the *Town and Country Planning Act 1961*.

"Financial Loss" compensation is only available when the person or entity was the owner of the property at the time the PAO was put in place. Compensation is assessed and paid if the owner incurs a loss as a result of a planning permit application being refused because the land is affected by a PAO.

"Loss on Sale" compensation is also only available when the person or entity was the owner of the property at the time the PAO was put in place. Compensation is assessed and paid if the owner sells the land at a lower price than he or she might reasonably have been expected to receive if the land or part of the land was not reserved.

Approximately 41 properties within the Punt Road PAO have been paid "Loss on Sale" compensation, totalling approximately \$2.4 million. The most recent payment was made in early 2015 and all other payments were made in the period from 1961 to 1999. VicRoads has recently received notification as required under the *Planning & Environment Act 1987* of a further claim for "Loss on Sale".

Recent title searches of the approximately 80 properties affected by the PAO but not owned by VicRoads or that have been subject to payments of planning compensation, identify that only up to three properties remain eligible for the owners to make claims for planning compensation. These three properties are still owned by the person or entity that owned them at the time the reservation was put in place. VicRoads has recently received a claim for Loss on Sale in respect of one of these properties. It is important to note that all other properties affected by the PAO were purchased with the PAO in place.

Any removal of the PAO from the planning scheme would likely result in an increase in the value of all properties affected by the PAO irrespective of whether any planning compensation has been paid.

Where any compensation has been paid, it can be recovered by the party that paid the compensation or its successor in law if the PAO is removed from the planning scheme. The amount recovered equates to the amount paid (plus GST as the removal of the Section 110 Notice which identifies compensation has been paid is deemed to be a taxable supply). There is no indexation applied over time. It is standard VicRoads practice to recover any compensation paid when a PAO is removed.

Any planning compensation that has been paid is taken into account if properties are subsequently acquired, by the application of a formula in accordance with Section 41(7) of the *Land Acquisition and Compensation Act 1986* which affects the amount payable at the time of acquisition.

The map in Appendix C shows the properties within the Punt Road PAO owned by VicRoads and which have had "Loss on Sale" compensation paid.

6.3. Current Planning Controls, Land Use & Built Form

The current planning controls, land use and built form for each property affected by the Punt Road PAO is detailed in a report in Appendix D prepared on behalf of VicRoads by *10 Consulting Group*.

All of the properties covered by the PAO are zoned residential except for those on the two Toorak Road corners which are zoned commercial (as part of the Toorak Road retail strip).

All of the properties covered by the PAO between Alexandra Avenue and Domain Road are within the General Residential Zone. The properties covered by the PAO along the rest of the corridor from Domain Road to Union Street are predominantly within the Residential Growth Zone. The exceptions are properties in the vicinity of Lang Street and Fawkner Street in South Yarra which are zoned Neighbourhood Residential and properties near Gladstone Street in Windsor which are zoned General Residential.

Consistent with the planning scheme zoning, the properties covered by the PAO are predominantly used for residential purposes with some commercial uses (retail and professional services) and a small number of properties used for car parking and tennis courts or that are vacant.

The Stonnington planning scheme also includes heritage overlays that affect about 40 properties within the PAO. The Hoddle Bridge over the Yarra River is also affected by a heritage overlay in the Yarra and Melbourne planning schemes (and a proposed heritage overlay in the Stonnington planning scheme). Alteration or demolition of buildings or structures affected by the heritage overlays would require planning permission.

7. Current and Future Road Configuration Options

VicRoads is investigating the feasibility, performance and impacts of various future options along Punt Road, including configurations within the existing road footprint and configurations that utilise the Punt Road PAO. This section provides an outline of the options under investigation. The outcomes of the investigations will be documented in an Options Report expected to be completed and publicly released later this year.

VicRoads is only investigating "at-grade" options along Punt Road and is not investigating any tunnels along the Punt Road alignment or overpasses or underpasses at intersections.

7.1. Current Configuration

Punt Road from Alexandra Avenue to just north of Union Street is generally a four lane undivided road with two lanes in each direction. The exact road reserve width (from property line to property line) along this length varies from approximately 17 metres at the northern end (near Domain Road) to approximately 21 metres at the southern end (near High Street).

At signalised intersections along this section of Punt Road, an exclusive right turn lane is added on Punt Road to form a five lane cross-section, generally via the narrowing of lanes and/or footpaths. There are no dedicated left turning lanes so traffic turning left shares the through lane.

There are no bicycle provisions within the Punt Road reserve and footpaths are relatively narrow.

There are no nature strips within the Punt Road reserve except for a short section on the western side of the road between High Street and Union Street. The only landscaping or plantations within the road reserve are trees planted within the footpath on the western side of the road. There are wooden power poles and overhead power lines on both sides of the road.

In recent years the two significant changes to the layout of this section of Punt Road have been:

- signalisation of the Pasley Street intersection with the associated removal of the pre-existing pedestrian operated signals, to improve safety and access (2013); and
- installation of exclusive right turn lanes on the Punt Road approaches to the Domain Road signalised intersection to improve safety and traffic flow (2011).

At Union Street, Punt Road flares out to an eight lane divided arterial road within an approximate 40 metre wide road reserve.

7.2. Future Configuration Options within Existing Road Reserve

7.2.1. Managing Parking and Right Turns

Clearways operate along Punt Road in both directions during weekday morning (6:30am to 9:30am) and evening (3:30pm to 6:30pm) peak periods only. On-street parking is allowed outside these times and contributes to congestion at these times.

Operating clearways over an extended period would significantly improve traffic operation outside the weekday commuter peak periods. However, there would be an impact on any residences and businesses that rely on on-street parking if alternative parking was not provided. Therefore, VicRoads is investigating a proposed full time (24 hour / 7 day week) clearway along Punt Road by converting a number of existing VicRoads owned properties along Punt Road into parking to off-set the loss of on-street parking.

However, extending clearway times may not address congestion during the critical weekday peak periods when clearways already operate. In addition to clearway changes, consideration is also being given to targeted parking restrictions on crossroads (in the vicinity of Punt Road) and right-turn bans to optimise the efficiency of intersection operations, including public transport, to provide some further improvements, particularly during weekday commuter peak periods.

7.2.2. Five Lane Treatment

VicRoads is also investigating the potential to realign lanes and narrow footpaths along Punt Road, so that a fifth lane can be introduced as a contra-flow /reversible lane without affecting existing properties, similar to Queens Road, Melbourne or Johnston Street, Collingwood.

Indicative cross-sections of a five lane treatment are shown in Figure 12 to 15. It is noted that the feasibility, safety, operation and impacts of any such treatment is subject to the outcome of the investigations, and the cross-sections shown are indicative only and may vary.

The indicative cross-section of the narrowest section of Punt Road, between Alexandra Avenue and Toorak Road, shows all five traffic lanes as 2.7 metres wide (with narrowed footpaths of 2.3 to 2.7 metres width). This is significantly narrower than the rest of Punt Road where 3.0 metre wide traffic lanes may be possible.

The 2011 installation of right turn lanes on the Punt Road approaches to Domain Road resulted in through traffic lanes of 2.7 - 2.8 metres width, a central right turn lane of 2.5 metres width and footpaths of 1.3 - 2.0 metres width. Whilst on balance this arrangement was considered acceptable to address a history of right turn crashes along Punt Road at this intersection, the application of a similar five lane arrangement along the full length of Punt Road between Alexandra Avenue and Toorak Road could raise some potential safety and amenity issues.

The contra-flow treatment along Queens Road restricts all right turn movements along its length, whereas currently, right turn movements are generally provided along Punt Road, including at signalised intersections. The investigations into this treatment will need to consider the restriction of right turn movements along Punt Road, including at intersections.

Figure 12: Indicative Cross Section Between Alexandra Avenue and Toorak Road

Figure 13: Indicative Cross Section Between Toorak Road and Commercial Road

Figure 14: Indicative Cross Section Between Commercial Road and High Street

Figure 15: Indicative Cross Section Between High Street and Union Road

7.3. Future Configuration Options outside Existing Road Reserve

The existing Punt road reserve combined with the Punt Road PAO makes for a possible future road reserve of a nominal 40 metre width.

This provides an opportunity for a major upgrade to a six lane divided cross-section between Union Street and just north of the Yarra River. This would include widening of the Hoddle Bridge over the Yarra River and upgrade of all existing signalised intersections along this section of Punt Road.

Figure 16 shows various indicative cross-sections for a divided six lane road within a nominal 40 metre road reserve. Whilst all these options provide for six lanes and a divided road (ie with a median) there are multiple variations as to how pedestrians, bicycles, buses and vegetation / trees may be accommodated along with variations to the width of various cross-section elements. As such, figure 15 does not necessarily show all possible variations, but provides an indication only as to what may be possible. The median for all the various indicative cross-sections would also need to provide for right turn lanes at key locations such as signalised intersections.

There are also options where the road reserve may vary along the length of Punt Road, particularly options for widening at signalised intersections only but not between signalised intersections.

There may also be other options for a widened road reserve within the PAO (such as 34 metres) and a widened road reserve beyond the PAO (such as 45 metres). Indicative cross-sections for such variations are attached to the report in Appendix A.

VicRoads highlights that there is no current commitment or proposal to widen the road into properties affected by the Punt PAO, and therefore no current need or intention to compulsorily acquire any properties. The long term options of any widening outside the existing road reserve are only being considered as part of the review of the Punt Road PAO in accordance its Terms of Reference.

Figure 16: Indicative Cross Sections for Divided Six Lane Road within 40 Metre Road Reserve

8. Discussion

8.1. Melbourne's Population Growth & Transport Challenge

Melburnian's make (on average) 3.13 trips per person per day, or a total of around 13.4 million trips per day in metropolitan Melbourne.

By 2051, Victoria is projected to have a population of 10 million people, with greater Melbourne anticipated to grow by 3.5 million to around 7.8 million people.

Assuming that Melburnian's will continue to make a similar number of trips per day (which they have done for several decades), then it is possible that Melburnians will make another 11 million person trips per day or a total of 24 million person trips per day across Melbourne.

It is clear that our current movement patterns cannot be sustained without a significant change in our approach to managing the use of road space, changes in community behaviour and expectation or without significant additions to the road and public transport networks.

8.2. Role of Punt Road - Hoddle Street in Melbourne's Transport Network

The Punt Road - Hoddle Street corridor plays a significant role in Melbourne's transport network connecting people with essential services, employment, business, educational, leisure and social activities. It is a complex environment that passes through a variety of precincts and neighbourhoods that include residential, industrial, commercial, retail, parks and reserves, sporting facilities, places of worship, major hospitals, and educational facilities.

The nature of the role that the corridor plays within the road network means that it must respond to a range of demands such as public transport, business travel, private traffic, local movements, parking, bicycles, pedestrians and local freight access, all competing for road space.

The disparities between the different transport and land uses along the corridor give rise to different issues that require different responses. While an accessible and reliable transport system is essential for people to gain access to employment, education, health, recreational and other services, as well as supporting social participation, access and ease of travel through the corridor for private and business travel is an important part of Melbourne's liveability and prosperity that contributes to the wellbeing of local communities.

Based upon previous planning for the corridor, there are known to be four significant traffic movements along Punt Road - Hoddle Street (with particular emphasis on Punt Road):

- North south traffic bypass, that is, they travel along almost the full length of Punt Road -Hoddle Street.
- East West Distributor, that is, the trip has started in the east or west and finished in the west or east and it has required travel along part of Punt Road.
- Corridor access, that is, the trip is assumed to have started and/or finished within a section 400m either side of Punt Road and required travel along Punt Road.
- East West Crossing, that is, the trip has crossed directly across Punt Road, without travelling along Punt Road.

8.3. Ongoing role of Punt Road

Punt Road is essentially an arterial road within a signalised arterial environment. To provide the best overall integrated transport outcome for the network, the future provision for the types of movements that occur on Punt Road needs to be considered. It is also recognised that demand will continue to grow for all movement types (bypass, east-west distributor, access and crossing) as densification of development occurs and the absence of alternative effective north-south continuous road links to the east of the Central Business District (CBD).

Punt Road will need to continue to provide the following functions:

• Facilitation of public transport predominantly servicing Melbourne's CBD

Given the close proximity to Melbourne Central Business District and the increasing densification of the population, provision to enable more cars to travel to the city centre is not a sustainable transport outcome. Public transport needs to be encouraged to maximise user choice of public transport in this inner metropolitan area. Bus and tram priority routes need to continue to be managed as a primary priority mode. These priorities include public transport travelling along and crossing Punt Road. Where public transport routes compete with each other for priority, priorities will need to be resolved, possibly at a localised level and based upon the level of people throughput. Opportunity for public transport growth should be locked into the system.

• General traffic bypass of the Melbourne CBD

There are no suitable alternative north south bypass routes within 10 kilometres to the east of the CBD, apart from Hoddle Street / Punt Road. Other alternatives lack connectivity and/or have significant competing demands such as shopping precincts, rail crossings and tram lines or they lead directly to the CBD. There is a need for a north south bypass of the Melbourne CBD where public transport does not meet the demand or the trip types are not suited to public transport such as freight or light commercial vehicle activity. This movement should also be retained as a primary priority mode movement. The opportunity for any improvement for traffic within the corridor should be retained for bypass trips rather than for east west vehicle trips. Where this movement competes with public transport, a decision on priorities would be made on an efficiency basis of moving people.

The remaining movement types for east-west traffic, corridor access and pedestrian and bicycle movements will be improved as the opportunity avails.

8.4. Connecting communities and providing better links

Given the role of Punt Road in Melbourne's transport network, there is significant potential for improving the liveability of Melbourne depending on transport decisions made for the corridor.

For Punt Road, the potential for improvement along the corridor would mean better public transport connections along the corridor, and improved traffic management to ensure traffic is not pushed onto other routes impinging on local amenity or public transport operations.

At a local level, this potential improvement represents an opportunity to improve liveability within the corridor so that people can interact easily, safely and in a pleasant environment. This means making sure that land use changes are integrated with transport planning, and that people have other viable travel options.

• Enhancement of amenity

The Punt Road corridor is lined with important community services such as schools, hospitals, places of worship, sporting facilities and aged care facilities. Improvements to public transport and better facilities for walking and cycling can help to counter the effects of traffic congestion along Punt Road and the surrounding local roads.

The key opportunities for enhancing the amenity, safety and function of the area are:

- Improve local amenity by responsibly reducing the impact of traffic; and
- Create a precinct that supports travel by public transport and active transport modes.

Improve local amenity by reducing the impact of traffic

There is a desire by the City of Stonnington to reduce the impact of traffic through the Chapel Street precinct and downgrade the use of Chapel Street by motor vehicles (refer Chapel Street ReVision Strategy). To a degree, a less congested Punt Road would assist in achieving this aim.

Create a precinct that supports travel by public transport and active transport modes

Improvements to pedestrian and bicycle crossings and better access to key public transport hubs are critical in driving sustainable mode choice and minimising the need for local traffic generation.

Improvements to the general pedestrian environment along Punt Road would create a more pleasant space and better opportunities for locals to walk and cycle within the corridor to most services. Enhancing the safety and function of the area would help create communities and create more of a sense of place.

Integration of Transport and Land Use

Any future development along the Punt Road corridor would have an implication for transport servicing and passing through Punt Road. To varying degrees, new developments would add pressure for car parking, pedestrian and bicycle access along and across the corridor, additional public transport demand and further general traffic demand.

The existing level of traffic and congestion along the corridor reduces the attractiveness for land use change. Appropriate and integrated improvements to transport operation would enable land use to change, the extent to which would be dependent on the level of compatibility of the transport change with land use integration. However, land use change would also bring additional local access requirements, from an increased need for walking and cycling, to public transport and business and private vehicle travel. This would result in increasing travel demand on the road corridor and any transport solution would need to consider that demand.

A planning matter to consider is whether given the strategic importance of Punt Road as a through traffic movement corridor, whether development along that corridor should be discouraged, to avoid creating incompatibility between the function of Punt Road, and its adjoining land uses. Furthermore, should Punt Road be widened within the PAO (if it were retained), a key question is whether access should be provided to adjoining properties on the side subject to the widening.

8.5. SmartRoads Framework

SmartRoads is an approach developed by VicRoads to manage the increasing number of trips on Victorian roads. *SmartRoads* is an approach that manages competing interests for limited road space by giving priority use of the road to different transport modes at particular times of the day.

The *SmartRoads* approach recognises the increasing importance of public transport, walking and cycling as transport modes. It uses a set of guiding principles to establish the priority use of roads by transport mode, time of day, and place of activity. This approach also ensures that decisions about the operation of the road network support integrated land use and transport planning.

Under *SmartRoads*, all road users continue to have access to all roads, but over time, changes are being made to how roads are operated to:

- facilitate good pedestrian access into and within activity centres in periods of high demand;
- prioritise trams and buses on key public transport routes that link activity centres during morning and afternoon peak periods;
- encourage cars to use alternative routes around activity centres to reduce the level of 'through' traffic;
- encourage bicycles through further developing the bicycle network; and

• prioritise trucks on important transport routes that link freight hubs and at times that reduce conflict with other transport modes.

These priority movements are assigned to arterial roads across the network forming SmartRoads Network Operating Plans.

SmartRoads Road Use Hierarchy Maps showing the priority modes on each road have been developed for each municipal area. These maps form the foundation for network operating plans. Extensive consultation was undertaken with local governments, government agencies and relevant stakeholders over several years to develop the Road Use Hierarchy.

Appendix E shows the SmartRoads Road Use Hierarchy Maps for the Stonnington, Port Phillip, Melbourne and Yarra local government areas. Specifically in relation to Punt Road and the surrounding key roads, the road use hierarchy is set out in Table 2.

Road	Location	Road Use Hierarchy
Punt Road	Between Alexandra Avenue and St Kilda Junction	 Preferred Traffic Route Bus Priority Route
Chapel Street	From north of Toorak Road to Dandenong Road	 Pedestrian Priority Area Bicycle Priority Route Tram Priority Route
St Kilda Road	Park Street to Commercial Road	 Bicycle Priority Route Tram Priority Route Bus Priority Route Traffic Route
	Commercial Road to St Kilda Junction	 Bicycle Priority Route Tram Priority Route Traffic Route
Alexandra Avenue	East of Punt Road	Preferred Traffic RouteBus Priority Route
Toorak Road	West of Punt Road	 Tram Priority Route Bicycle Priority Route Traffic Route
	East of Punt Road	 Tram Priority Route Bicycle Priority Route Pedestrian Priority Area Traffic Route
Commercial Road	East and West of Punt Road	 Tram Priority Route Bus Priority Route Bicycle Priority Route Traffic Route
High Street	East and West of Punt Road	 Tram Priority Route Bicycle Priority Route Traffic Route

 Table 2: Smart Roads Road Use Hierarchy for Key Roads

In particular, it is noted that Punt Road is designated as a "Preferred Traffic Route" and "Bus Priority Route", recognising its importance for these functions. "Preferred traffic routes" represent those arterial roads that are preferred for carrying large volumes of through traffic over other roads to reduce conflicts with abutting land uses. "Preferred traffic routes" will also tend to form the primary routes for longer distance travel demand. All arterial roads declared under the Road Management Act 2004 that are not designated as "Preferred traffic routes" are considered as "Traffic routes".

8.6. Traffic

The Punt Road – Hoddle Street corridor is the only inter-regional continuous north-south route in the area. The corridor provides a major north-south arterial connection to various highways and freeways, an eastern bypass of the Melbourne CBD, and a key access to the Melbourne CBD and nearby suburbs and attractions (including employment areas and sporting grounds) and is a Preferred Traffic Route under the SmartRoads Road Use Hierarchy.

There are no adjacent routes near Punt Road that provide an effective alternative north-south route. Nearby north-south routes such as St Kilda Road, Chapel Street, Williams Road and Glenferrie Road are discontinuous and/or heavily congested by traffic and/or tram operation. The Punt Road PAO provides the only opportunity for providing additional north-south capacity (at-grade) in the sub-region.

This route and the option to widen it could become increasingly important as Melbourne grows from a population of 4.3 million to the 7.8 million in 2051 as forecast in *Plan Melbourne*.

Plan Melbourne also recognises the importance of improving the efficiency of freight networks while also protecting urban amenity. It identifies a Principal Freight Network that includes the Punt Road-Hoddle Street corridor that connects the Nepean Highway, Monash Freeway and Eastern Freeway freight corridors.

The freight function of the Punt Road – Hoddle Street corridor is not for cross-metropolitan heavy vehicle movements as this is generally performed by Melbourne's freeway network which more directly links Melbourne's key freight generating nodes in outer northern, western and south eastern Melbourne.

Depending on exact location, in the south east of Melbourne, the Monash Freeway and Nepean Highway-Queens Road-Kings Way corridors provide the primary heavy vehicle movements routes connecting to the West Gate Freeway and freight generating nodes in the west and north (via City Link and the Western Ring Road). Whilst the Nepean Highway freight corridor connects to both the Punt Road and Queens Road-Kings Way routes, unlike Kings Way, Punt Road does not directly connect to the M1 corridor to and from the west.

Whilst the Punt Road – Hoddle Street corridor can provide network resilience by allowing heavy vehicles to move between the freeways if major incidents or delays occur, the key freight function of the corridor relates to its heavy use by light commercial, trade vehicles and smaller trucks servicing the many activity centres throughout the inner suburbs, As such, congestion on the corridor can have a significant impact on the subregional economy.

VicRoads is aiming to improve the predictability and reliability of travel for general traffic on Melbourne's higher order traffic routes, such as the Punt Road – Hoddle Street corridor. Any future widening of Punt Road would improve the predictability and reliability of travel for general traffic, particularly during peak times when volume/capacity ratios are high, and significantly improve the level of safety and reduce crashes.

The daily volume of traffic on Punt Road can vary depending on location, day of the week (weekday versus weekend) and time of year (eg holiday periods). The Average Annual Daily Traffic (AADT) volumes is the sum of all traffic using the road for a year, divided by 365, and therefore takes into account the day of the week and time of year.

Table 3 show the AADT volumes along the various sections of Punt Road and how these have changed over time. They show that daily traffic volumes have largely declined since 2003. At some locations, traffic volumes have further declined between 2010 and 2013, while at other locations, traffic volumes have largely been stable between 2010 and 2013. These results are broadly consistent with an overall decline in vehicle kilometres of travel in inner Melbourne (although speeds have declined by even more).

Location	2003	2010	2011	2012	2013
Punt Rd Northbound between Union St & High St	16,000	13,000	14,000	13,000	13,000
Punt Rd Southbound between High St & Union St	18,000	15,000	14,000	15,000	15,000
Punt Rd Northbound between High St & Moubray St	15,000	15,000	15,000	15,000	15,000
Punt Rd Southbound between Moubray St & High St	18,000	15,000	15,000	14,000	14,000
Punt Rd Northbound between Moubray St & Commercial Rd	18,000	15,000	14,000	14,000	14,000
Punt Rd Southbound between Commercial Rd & Moubray St	16,000	16,000	16,000	16,000	16,000
Punt Rd Northbound between Commercial Rd & Toorak Rd	19,000	16,000	16,000	15,000	15,000
Punt Rd Southbound between Toorak Rd & Commercial Rd	19,000	16,000	16,000	15,000	15,000
Punt Rd Northbound between Toorak Rd & Domain Rd	20,000	16,000	15,000	15,000	15,000
Punt Rd Southbound between Domain Rd & Toorak Rd	21,000	18,000	17,000	17,000	17,000
Punt Rd Northbound between Domain Rd & Alexandra Ave	20,000	16,000	15,000	14,000	14,000
Punt Rd Southbound between Alexandra Ave & Domain Rd	23,000	19,000	18,000	19,000	19,000

Table 3: Traffic Volumes along Punt Road, over Time

On typical weekdays, Punt Road currently carries around 30,000 to 40,000 vehicles per day, which as expected, is higher than the AADT volumes.

The complementary report by Traffic Works in Appendix F provides more detailed information on existing conditions along Punt Road including road user volumes, travel times, safety issues and parking.

Traffic experiences significant congestion in the weekday and weekend peak periods, particularly at the Punt Road/Toorak Road and Punt Road /Alexandra Avenue intersections. Other key intersections along this section of Punt Road are High Street and Commercial Road.

To minimise congestion, VicRoads has refined signal timings at intersections to prioritise north-south traffic flow, however any further modifications would adversely impact on public transport services crossing Punt Road.

8.7. Public Transport

Along with being a Preferred Traffic Route, Punt Road is also a Bus Priority Route and makes an important contribution to north-south tram operations by diverting traffic away from Priority Tram Routes such as St Kilda Road and Chapel Street, consistent with the priorities for those routes. In the absence of any interventions, traffic volumes could increase on St Kilda Road and Chapel Street, with consequential increases in traffic and tram delays.

Three Tram Priority Routes (High Street, Commercial Road and Toorak Road) and two Bus Priority Routes (Commercial Road and Alexandra Avenue) also cross this section of Punt Road. High Street, Commercial Road and Toorak Road each carry one tram route. Commercial Road carries three bus routes and Alexandra Avenue one bus route. These public transport services are delayed at Punt Road due to limited available east-west capacity and priority given to Punt Road.

Figure 17 shows local public transport in the vicinity of Punt Road, with the following number of services in a peak hour (in both directions of travel):

- Route 8 tram (Toorak Road): 18 services
- Route 72 tram (Commercial Road): 14 services
- Route 6 tram (High Street): 14 services
- Route 246 bus: (Punt Road): 12 services
- Route 605 bus (Alexandra Avenue): 8 services
- Route 216 bus (Commercial Road): 4 services
- Route 219 bus (Commercial Road): 4 services
- Route 220 bus (Commercial Road): 8 services

The ability to widen Punt Road will be important in enabling faster and more reliable public transport services in respect of buses which operate along Punt Road and tram and bus services which cross this section of Punt Road.

The Route 246 bus operates along Punt Road, providing the only direct connection between the bayside/inner suburbs of Elsternwick, Elwood, St Kilda, South Yarra and Richmond and the inner northern suburbs of Clifton Hill, Fitzroy and Collingwood, reducing the need for patrons to travel into and out of inner Melbourne. This is reflected in the route's designation as part of the Principal Public Transport Network, as it services key destinations including the MCG, Melbourne Park, St Kilda shops, the Alfred Hospital, Wesley College, Elwood College and Collingwood College. The route connects with rail services at Elsternwick, Richmond, North Richmond, Collingwood, Victoria Park and Clifton Hill stations, and intersects with trams operating on Victoria Parade, Bridge Road, Swan Street, Toorak Road, Commercial Road, High Street, Dandenong Road and Carlisle Street.

On weekdays, the Route 246 bus service operates to a ten minute frequency between 6am and 7pm, with services operating from 5.40am - 11.30pm. On weekends, it operates to a 15 minute frequency, and a 20 minute frequency on Sundays. The service averages 5,300 boardings per weekday and in 2011-12 was the tenth busiest bus route in Melbourne. Preliminary demand forecasting suggests that patronage on the route will continue to grow, with 5,500 to 6,000 boardings on average per day in 2021. As a result, the frequency is proposed to be 5 minutes (12 services an hour) in the peaks, and a flat 10 minute frequency at other times (6 services an hour). By 2031, 7,000 to 8,000 people per weekday are expected to use this service, therefore it is important that the service is reliable and travel times are reasonable.

Passenger loads on east-west tram routes in the area are also expected to grow strongly, therefore tram priority for these movements will be essential to improve reliability and travel times. Preliminary demand forecasts indicate that the number of tram users crossing Punt Road at Toorak Road, Commercial Road and High Street per weekday will be between 24,000 and 28,000 passengers in 2021 and between 25,000 and 30,000 in 2031.

Figure 17: Current local public transport routes in the vicinity of Punt Road

Melbourne owns a very valuable asset having the biggest operating tram network in the world with around 250 kilometres of double track and over 1,700 tram stops across the network. Annual patronage for 2012-13 was 183 million boardings.

However, with around 80% of this network operating as street car system - sharing road space with other vehicles - the asset is being underutilised. The average speed of a tram is 16 km/h. Within the central business district this drops to 11 km/h.

As employment and population continues to grow in central Melbourne, trams will need to take up a lot of the additional trips with origins and destinations within a 10-15km radius of the centre of Melbourne.

One option for an upgrade of Punt Road utilising the PAO would be to provide improved priority for east west trams on Toorak Road, Commercial Road and High Street. This would be able to be achieved by having additional traffic signal green time for east west roads, enabled by the provision of additional north-south traffic lanes on Punt Road.

Alternatively, or in addition, to providing additional traffic signal green time to east-west roads, if there was some widening on the Toorak Road, Commercial Road and/or High Street approaches to Punt Road (similar to the widening of Victoria Street, Bridge Road and Swan Street on the eastern intersection legs when Hoddle Street/Punt Road was widened, north of the Yarra River), then trams could be separated from other traffic on intersection approaches, with benefits to tram passengers and motorists.

Both of these potential solutions would make tram travel more attractive to potential tram passengers, by lessening tram travel times and in the case of intersection widening, making use of the tram safer, by better separating intending tram passengers from car movements.

With respect to buses, one option for a widened Punt Road would be to provide improved priority for north-south buses, either through the use of exclusive bus lanes along the whole length, or alternatively, through the use of bus priority lanes at intersections. Another option would be to provide improved priority for east west buses. This would be able to be achieved by having additional traffic signal green time for east west roads, enabled by the provision of additional north-south traffic lanes on Punt Road.

Nearly all public transport trips link with walking trips, but a significant number of Melbourne's public transport users undertake multi-modal 'motorised' trips. In 2011, 30 per cent of train trips, 34 per cent of tram trips and 45 per cent of all bus trips in Melbourne involved transfers to other public transport modes, giving Melbourne the second highest proportion of public transport multi-modal commuter trips across Australia's five largest cities. If tram and bus services do not have predictability and reliability in connecting to train services, then the overall public transport system suffers.

Measures directed towards improving travel times for trams and buses on east west roads and buses on Punt Road would be anticipated to improve reliability, thereby improving the ability for people to undertake multimodal travel journeys.

8.8. Walking and Cycling

The average person walks at around 5 km/h, at an easy pace, up to around 6.5 km/h at a moderate pace - which equates to a distance of about 1.7 km to 2.1 km in 20 minutes. Research undertaken in Melbourne also indicates that the majority (85th percentile) of people will walk up to around 1.85 km to a usual workplace, around 1.6 km to a train station and about 1.3 km to a shop or primary school.

Currently about 40% of trips under 2km in metropolitan Melbourne and 30% of trips under 2 km in regional centres are walked. However, in places like central Melbourne and Yarra, this rises to about 70%. Vista data (2007) indicates that about 50% of trips less than 1 km are made by car in outer Melbourne and in our regional cities and centres. This drops to about 40% in middle Melbourne, 30% in inner Melbourne and 15% in the City. There will therefore be a focus on trips less than 2 km in length for the purpose of shopping, leisure, work and education as it is considered that this is the area of highest potential for increasing walking for transport.

In a city like Copenhagen where cycling is a mainstream transport mode, the average travel speed is about 15.5 km/h -which equates to a distance of about 5 km in 20 minutes. Depending on location and conditions, cycling can also be the fastest way to travel over distances up to 5km. In metropolitan Melbourne alone, around 37% of trips less than 3 km and 53% of trips less than 5 km are currently made by car.

An analysis of cycling potential undertaken by Transport for London in 2010 yielded several useful findings. The analysis looked at all trips in London. Of those that are made by motorised modes, it then filtered out trips not suitable for cycling, including: person carrying heavy or bulk load, trip longer than 8 km, trip would take greater than 20% more time to travel, traveller is under 5 or over 64, trip is made between 8pm and 6am, traveller has a disability affecting their travel, trip made by van, dial-a-ride, etc. This still found 35% of all trips currently being made by mechanised modes to be potentially cyclable with 40% being for the purpose of shopping and leisure, 25% for work and 18% for education. These 3 or 4 trip purposes represent over 80% of the transferable trips.

Of all potentially cyclable trips, 80% were less than 5km in length and could be made by most people in less than 20 minutes.

So, for trips less than 5km in length for the purpose of shopping, leisure, work (including access to train) and education, approximately 20% of the trips currently made by mechanised modes could be cyclable; of which about 70% would be transferrable from cars.

There is huge potential for societal change in terms of affecting a shift from cars to walking and cycling for trips to school. In the 24 years from 1970 to 1994, walking and cycling for trips to school declined from 63% to 26% of mode share in metropolitan Melbourne and from 56% to 24% of mode share in regional Victoria. Over the same period, car trips to school rose from 26% to 55% of mode share in metropolitan Melbourne and from 24% to 44% of mode share in regional Victoria.

Punt Road is not currently a Bicycle Priority Route or Pedestrian Priority Route. Footpaths along Punt Road are relatively narrow and there are no bicycle facilities.

Given the relative importance of traffic, freight and bus movement functions and existing constraints, the provision of bicycle lanes along Punt Road within the existing road reservation is not considered feasible given likely impacts on other road users and safety concerns.

Bicycle Priority Routes are nominated and supported on the key parallel routes of St Kilda Road and Chapel Street (on which VicRoads has been recently improving the bicycle network).

Any widening of Punt Road to six lanes should help facilitate enhanced bicycle and pedestrian provisions, and associated safety and amenity for these users, on the road network in the surrounding area and along Punt Road itself.

9. Summary of Advantages and Disadvantages of Retaining or Removing PAO

9.1. Advantages of Retaining the PAO

The PAO preserves opportunities and options for a major upgrade along the Punt Road corridor in the future, subject to extensive community consultation in conjunction with detailed project assessments prior to any construction. The upgrade could include a six lane divided cross-section between Union Street and just north of the Yarra River. This could include widening of the Hoddle Bridge over the Yarra River and upgrade of all existing signalised intersections along this section of Punt Road.

Subject to further investigations, the upgrade might have the following benefits:

- Improved travel time and safety for vehicular traffic, including buses, along Punt Road;
- Improved tram and bus operations by reducing delays on east-west tram and bus routes crossing Punt Road and diverting traffic away from nearby north-south tram routes such as St Kilda Road and Chapel Street;
- Enhanced amenity and safety for the Chapel Street and St Kilda Road precincts by helping divert through traffic out of these areas;
- Better accommodation of north-south transport demands within the inner eastern suburbs, with no other routes able to provide an effective alternative arterial route;
- Support for travel demands associated with the forecast high growth in employment and population in inner Melbourne over the next 20 years and beyond;
- Improvements to the level of service, safety and amenity for pedestrians and cyclists ; and
- Streetscape and public realm improvements via the possible provision of nature strips, medians and associated landscaping and vegetation, including the conversion of Punt Road into a Boulevard with trees in the median and roadsides.

VicRoads indicative estimate for such an upgrade is in the order of \$500 million. By comparison, tunnelling under this section of Punt Road may be 5 - 10 times that figure and could present significant technical challenges and major disruption during construction.

Removal of the PAO could eliminate the ability to substantially improve the operation, safety and amenity of Punt Road, resulting in the following:

- Punt Road being an ongoing constraint in the road network, with traffic, buses and trams using and/or crossing Punt Road experiencing increasing congestion and delay;
- Surrounding roads experiencing increasing congestion and delay for public transport, as traffic diverts to these roads from the congested Punt Road;
- Increasingly poor accessibility to social and economic opportunities along Punt Road and nearby roads, including the Alfred Medical Research and Education Precinct, nearby activity centres and sporting and entertainment facilities such as the Melbourne Cricket Ground, AAMI Park, Hisense Arena and the Melbourne Park National Tennis Centre;
- Minimal opportunities to enhance the level of service, safety and amenity for pedestrians and cyclists along Punt Road; and
- Minimal opportunities for any public realm and streetscape improvements.

Removal of the PAO would also facilitate larger scale development along Punt Road that could have the disadvantage of conflicting with the important traffic function of the road.

9.2. Disadvantages of Retaining the PAO

The PAO currently creates a high level of disincentive to undertake improvements to properties and develop land affected by the PAO. This potentially also results in poorer urban design and amenity outcomes on this adjacent land, than may otherwise be the case.

While there are substantial potential benefits in easing congestion and improving accessibility for the local community through an upgrade to a six-lane divided road from Union Street to just north of the Yarra River, the potential increased traffic along Punt Road might also adversely affect the amenity of properties adjacent to both sides of Punt Road.

Benefits of removing the PAO include the following.

- Owners of properties within the PAO having more certainty about the future of the road and their properties.
- The PAO acts as an encumbrance to private development within the overlay along the east side of Punt Road, limiting the potential for improved urban design and amenity outcomes on this adjacent land in the short to medium term, and the potential to increase the scale and extent of development that may be possible (subject to planning approvals).
- The statutory controls in the planning scheme associated with the PAO create additional procedural requirements, and potentially associated time and costs, for land owners proposing to undertake some works within the PAO. This also creates additional requirements for Stonnington City Council to administer the statutory processes, and VicRoads to assess and respond to referral of such planning permit applications.
- The PAO prevents the State from potentially realising the full value of VicRoads land holdings for development purposes.
- Removal of the PAO would also likely result in an increase in the value of all properties (approximately 140) affected by the PAO, including the 22 VicRoads properties. However, for the 41 properties where previous owners have been paid 'Loss on Sale' compensation, the current owners would incur a legal requirement to repay the compensation to VicRoads. However, there is no indexation applied over time to the amount that would need to be repaid, and compensation on all of the 41 properties, bar one which was paid this year, was paid from 1961 to 1999.